"We come and go, but the land is always here.
And the people who love it and understand it are the people who own it—for a little while."

Willa Cather, O Pioneers!

Senses of Place

Edited by Steven Feld and Keith H. Basso

School of American Research Press Post Office Box 2188 Santa Fe, New Mexico 87504-2188 www.sarweb.org

Director of Publications: Joan K. O'Donnell Editor: Jane Kepp Designer: Deborah Flynn Post Indexer: Douglas J. Easton Typographer: Tseng Information Systems, Inc. Printer: Thomson-Shore, Inc.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data:
Senses of place / edited by Steven Feld and Keith H. Basso.
p. cm. — (School of American Research advanced seminar series)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-933452-94-2 (cloth). — ISBN 0-933452-95-0 (paper)
1. Human geography—Philosophy. 2. Ethnology—Philosophy.
3. Geographical perception. I. Feld, Steven. II. Basso, Keith, 1940—III. Series.
GF21.S45 1996
304.273—dc20

93-31354

© 1996 by the School of American Research. All rights reserved. Manufactured in the United States of America. Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 96-31354. International Standard Book Numbers 0-933452-94-2 (cloth) and 0-933452-95-0 (paper). Third paperback printing 2000.

Cover: "Road Taken. 95," by Carol Anthony. Craypas and enamel on gessoed panel. © 1996 Carol Anthony. Courtesy of the Gerald Peters Gallery, Santa Fe. Photo by Dan Morse.

Contents

List of Illustrations ix
Acknowledgments xi

Introduction ¶ 3
Steven Feld and Keith H. Basso

- How to Get from Space to Place in a Fairly Short Stretch of Time: Phenomenological Prolegomena 1 13

 Edward S. Casey
- l Wisdom Sits in Places: Notes on a Western Apache Landscape 53 Keith H. Basso
- Waterfalls of Song: An Acoustemology of Place Resounding in Bosavi, Papua New Guinea # 91 Steven Feld
- 4 An Occupied Place 1 137

 Kathleen C. Stewart
- Your Place and Mine: Sharing Emotional Landscapes in Wamira, Papua New Guinea 167
 Miriam Kalıı
- 6 "Where Do You Stay At?": Homeplace and Community among the Lumbee 1 197 Karen I. Blu

power is given to very few people and comes mainly from dreams and visions. It should also be noted that possession of supernatural power does not necessarily imply the presence of wisdom. As Dudley Patterson's story of the grasshopper plague at Cibeccue illustrates clearly, persons with supernatural power sometimes at the city of the grasshopper plague at the city of the

Cibecue illustrates clearly, persons with supernatural power sometimes act unwisely.

13. The idea that smooth-minded thinker and wise story character "flow swiftly together" is nicely consistent with other dimensions of the water imagery that pervades the Apache model of wisdom. The fact that wisdom is likened by Apaches to water—and that using wisdom, or drinking it, is considered basic to survival—seems more than appropriate for a people who have lived for centuries in a demand-

14. It is just for this reason, I believe, that novelists and journalists are often more successful than academic writers in conveying to readers an unfamiliar sense of place. Rather than trying to describe sense of place, or somehow attempting to characterize it, the former seek to *evoke* it by presenting a host of local details and taking note gest that similar strategies, suitably modified, can be usefully employed by cultural anthropologists and other social scientists interested in the problem.

15. For several years after Dudley Patterson's untimely death, I sought without nity. Everyone I approached gave the same reason for resisting my overtures, namely that he or she could add nothing to what Dudley had already taught me. "But how can you be so sure?" I asked one of my Apache friends in the summer of 1985. "I'm

sure," Nick Thompson replied. "You had a good teacher. You know what you're supposed to know. Don't get greedy. It's not wise." On that unequivocal note, I let the matter drop and found other things to do.

Waterfalls of Song

An Acoustemology of Place Resounding in Bosavi, Papua New Guinea Steven Feld

almost completely transparent. But how is place actually sensed? How are the perceptual engagements we call sensing critical to conceptual constructions of place? And how does this feelingful sensuality participate in naturalizing one's sense of place? These questions guide my inquiry into the sensing and sensuality underlying how places are named and poetically evoked by Kaluli people of Bosavi, Papua New Guinea. My desire is to illuminate a doubly reciprocal motion: as place is sensed, senses are placed; as places make sense, senses make place. Because sound and an ear- and voice-centered sensorium are central to Kaluli experience and expression in the tropical rainforest, the goal of this exploration is to interpret what I call an acoustemology, by which I mean local conditions of acoustic sensation, knowledge, and imagination embodied in the culturally particular sense of place resounding in Bosavi.

sia, and soundscapes that provide context for the general framework of of place. I outline ways in which research on acoustic experience and my inquiry, that of a social phenomenology and hermeneutics of senses a Kaluli acoustemology of place relations, a fusion of space and time that ney that flows along local waterways and through local lands. The flow contours. This trope of flow is then examined as it appears in poetic song encountered and imagined to be like the flow of voice through the body's practices to show how the inseparability of rainforest waters and lands is sections on the acoustemology of flow. The first treats Kaluli naming introduce the sound world of the Kaluli. Next I offer two ethnographic expression of place has remained relatively underdeveloped and then joins lives and events as embodied memories. The evocative powers of sensual flow of the singing voice. Connecting these flowing paths reveals of these poetic song paths is emotionally and physically linked to the texts, where singing a sequence of named places takes listeners on a jour-The chapter opens with brief notes on sensation, sound, synesthe-

this acoustemology reach an aesthetic apex in poetic performance, where the expressive flow of the voice merges with the experiential flow of sung placenames to create waterfalls of song, a sense of place resounding.

SENSE, EMBODIMENT, SYNESTHESIA

"Perception does not give me truth like geometry but presences" (Merleau-Ponty 1964:14). What are these "presences" that are given in perception? Merleau-Ponty insisted that they were first the presences of feeling and perceiving bodies, bodies whose sensory experience was never fully sublimated to abstract cognition. Sensations, he urged, were always experienced presences, presences of what later cognitive psychologists and philosophers called an "embodied mind" (Varela, Thompson, and Rosch 1991) or a "body in the mind" (Johnson 1987).

But the senses, the body's "sensorimotor surfaces," are not limited to embodied presences, and they constitute more than experiential sites for establishing points and places of physical and social contact (Straus 1963). Drew Leder's *The Absent Body* (1990) develops this line of critique to ask why, if the body is so central to sensory experience, if it so actively situates the subject, might it also be so experientially absent or out-of-focus. Why is the body not the direct thematic object of one's attention and experience, and why does it recede from direct experience? Leder develops these questions by addressing Merleau-Ponty's observation, made in *The Structure of Behavior* (1963), that "to be situated within a certain point of view necessarily involves not seeing that point of view" (Leder 1990:12). He elaborates: "This constitutes the necessary supplement to the Gestaltist figure-background description of perception. As Merleau-Ponty writes [in *The Phenomenology of Perception*, 1962]: 'one's own body is always the third term, always tacitly understood in the figure-background structure, and every figure stands out against the double horizon of external and bodily space'" (Leder 1990:13).

Leder's conjecture as to why some bodily dimensions are always experientially foregrounded while others are backgrounded relies on the same "figure-ground gestalt to characterize not only the body's field of experience but the structure of the experiencing body itself" (Leder 1990:24). He claims that "these modes of absence arise directly out of the fundamental structure of embodiment," further characterizing "the lived body as an ecstatic/recessive being, engaged both in a leaping out and a falling back. Through its sensorimotor surface it projects outward to the world. At the same time it recedes from its own apprehension into anonymous visceral depths. The body is never a simple presence, but that which is away from itself, a being of difference and absence" (Leder 1990:103; see also Levin 1985; Schilder 1950)

Jackson 1989:119-55; Ohnuki-Tierney 1991). horizon of knowledge by making actual what were before only potential meanings" (Marks 1978:254). Taussig's Mimesis and Alterity argues that tinually linking bodily experience to thought and to action (Feld 1988 modality to another, present at one level while absent at others, conresemblances that echo, vibrate, and linger as traces from one sensory perceived blur and merge through sensuous contact, experiencing inner thetic potential also recalls iconicity, or the ways in which perceiver and power from the represented" (1993:2). This same metaphoric and synespower of replication . . . wherein the representation shares in or takes this metaphoric and synesthetic potential recalls mimesis, "the magical reveals how "the synesthetic, like the metaphoric in general, expands the senses bleeding into each other's zone of expectations" (Taussig 1993:57) from simultaneous joint perceptions (Cytowic 1989). This "medley of the sources, the tingling resonances and bodily reverberations that emerge of sensory ratios, the rich connections inherent in multiple sensation dality to another" (Marks 1978:8). Synesthesia points to the complexity "the transposition of sensory images or sensory attributes from one monance and subordination switch or commingle, blur into synesthesia, or correspondences. Figure-ground interplays, in which one sense surand grounds, constant potentials for multi- or cross-sensory interactions of the senses. Lived experience involves constant shifts in sensory figures body clearly implicates another interactive figure-and-background, that faces in the midst of another that recedes, in which positions of domi-Establishing this complex and multiple presence and absence of the

But sensation, sensual presence, is still more than embodiment, more than perceptual figure-grounds, more than the potential for synesthesia. It was Henri Bergson's insight, long ago in *Matter and Memory*, that "there is no perception which is not full of memories. With the immediate and present data of our senses, we mingle a thousand details out of our past experience" (1988 [1908]:33). Hence, "what you have to explain . . . is not how perception arises, but how it is limited, since it should be the image of the whole, and is in fact reduced to the image of that which interests you" (1988 [1908]:40). Bergson's problem—linking the active body as a place of passage to processes of making memory—is developed in Edward Casey's *Remembering* (1987). He writes:

Moving in or through a given place, the body imports its own emplaced past into its present experience: its local history is literally a history of locales. This very importation of past places occurs simultaneously with the body's ongoing establishment of directionality, level and distance, and indeed influences these latter in myriad ways. Orientation in place (which is what is established by these three factors) cannot be continually effected *de novo* but arises within the ever-lengthening shadow of our bodily past. (1987:194)

Because motion can draw upon the kinesthetic interplay of tactile, sonic, and visual senses, emplacement always implicates the intertwined nature of sensual bodily presence and perceptual engagement.

LANDSCAPE, ACOUSTIC SPACE, SOUNDSCAPE

The overwhelmingly multisensory character of perceptual experience should lead to some expectation for a multisensory conceptualization of place. But by and large, ethnographic and cultural-geographic work on senses of place has been dominated by the visualism deeply rooted in the European concept of landscape. Denis Cosgrove has analyzed how two distinct notions of landscape, both sharing a pervasive visualism, have merged in the West. In the first instance, over some four hundred years,

the idea of landscape came to denote the artistic and literary representation of the visible world, the scenery (literally that which is seen) which is viewed by a spectator. It implied a particular sensibility... closely connected to a growing dependency on the faculty of sight as the medium through which truth was to be attained: 'seeing is believing.' Significant technical innovations for representing this truth included single-point perspective and the invention of aids to sight like the microscope, telescope, and camera." (1984:9)

In the second case, that of landscape as a notion incorporated into the analytical concerns of academic geography, the concept "denotes the integration of natural and human phenomena which can be empirically verified and analyzed by the methods of scientific enquiry over a delimited portion of the earth's surface" (1984:9). Cosgrove argues that these two senses of landscape "are intimately connected both historically and in terms of a common way of appropriating the world through the objectivity accorded to the faculty of sight and its related technique of pictorial representation" (1984:9).

But what of place as heard and felt? Place as sounding or resounding? In contrast to the long history of the landscape idea in both artistic and scientific inquiry and representation, approaches to ways in which worlds are sonically apprehended have shallower histories. Arguing this same evidential or representational primacy as visual "insight," Edmund Space" in their journal Explorations (1953–59). The term derived from nology concerning media transformations, specifically the ways the history of orality and literacy could be reinterpreted from the vantage point Carpenter's article on acoustic space was the first statement describing

the cultural implications of a directionally simultaneous and diffuse "earpoint," his alternative to "viewpoint" (1960). His later studies (1971, 1973, 1980) went on to relate acoustic space to visual-auditory interplays, as in the way the Inuit experience of spherical dynamic space in the Arctic related to local artistic imagination and process, especially visual puns and depictions of motion, depth, and noncontainment.

sophical critique of musical Platonism (Higgins 1991), in anthropological retical essays on symbol and metaphor (1986). Basso (1985) and Paul Stoller (1989:101-22), and in Roy Wagner's theoexplorations of ritual, music, and sound symbolism in the work of Ellen with time in the progression and motion of tones (1956:267–348). While had a critical impact elsewhere, as in Kathleen Higgins's vigorous philothe first volume of Zuckerkandl's Sound and Symbol (1956), has certainly this interpenetration of auditory space and time has not had a general tone as time. He did so by detailing ways in which space is audibly fused vigorously against the notion that music was purely an experience of tual psychology of William James, Géza Révész, and Erwin Straus, argued impact on theorizations of space and place, Music and the External World, Martin Heidegger and on the psychophysics and the Gestalt and percepan entirely different context. The music philosopher Victor Zuckerkandl (1956), drawing substantially on the philosophy of Henri Bergson and The notion of "auditory space" also emerged in the mid-1950s, in

Just as Zuckerkandl the musician influenced anthropologists, Carpenter the anthropologist principally influenced musicians. When composer Murray Schafer organized the World Soundscape Project at Simon Fraser University in 1970, the Carpenter and McLuhan ideas, marginal both in 1960s, were introduced to composers and acousticians in a new framework, the study of the sound environment and acoustic communication. Schafer's group began recording, observing, and acoustically analyzing and developed an analytical vocabulary, a notation system, and a comparative framework for the study of acoustic space and its human interpretation and feedback. This work went under the general rubrics of two terms coined by Schafer, "acoustic ecology" and "soundscape design."

Schafer and his colleagues disseminated their ideas in media ranging from music compositions to radio collages and from technical reports to print and cassette travel journals, all of which led to a general synthesis, Schafer's *The Tuning of the World* (1977). This book has drawn substantial attention to the acoustic complexities of environments, especially northern ones, but its impact has largely been felt among musicians, acousticians, architectural designers, and audio and radio artist-

composer-recordists (for example, see Schafer 1993; Truax 1984; Werner 1992). Acoustic ecology and soundscape studies have had rather less impact on ethnographers, who might study how people hear, respond to, and imagine places as sensually sonic. On the other hand, humanistic geography, deeply impacted by perspectives from phenomenology in the 1970s and 1980s, began to notice the acoustic dimensions of place somewhat less cautiously (for example, Buttimer and Seamon 1980; Seamon 1979; Seamon and Mugerauer 1985; Tuan 1977) but rarely explored them, and never in the fully grounded way that would draw anthropological

The work of the Carpenter-McLuhan-Schafer lineage was not taken up seriously by anthropologists; indeed, it was criticized by those most interested in its consequences for analyzing both the senses and orality-literacy issues (Feld 1986; Finnegan 1988:139-74). Despite its stated concern with sensory ratios, this line of thinking often reified a visual-auditory great divide, one that reproduced some variant of the notion that "seeing is analytical and reflective. Sound is active and generative" (Schafer 1985:96). Such oversimplified rhetoric led most ethnographers to turn their ears and sparked the critical tack taken by Don Idhe, whose phenomenological essay *Listening and Voice* pointed out the futility of countering the historical centrality of visualism in Western analytical discourses by simply erecting an antivisualism (1976:21).

What Idhe called for instead—a call recently echoed by anthropologist David Howes in *The Varieties of Sensory Experience* (1991:3–21, 167–91)—was a reevaluation of all the senses from the standpoint of their interplay. Only then, Idhe and Howes both claimed, could a serious analysis of sound emerge in an adequately experiential or ethnographic way. Given recurring tendencies to essentialize vision as a characteristic of the West (e.g., Ong 1982), in polar opposition to a presumed centrality of sound, smell, and taste that is essentialized to non-Western cultural "others," a reevaluation of sensory ratios must scrutinize how tendencies for sensory dominance always change contextually with bodily emplacement. That perspective informs my position on sound in sensory experience, specifically its implications for interpreting life-worlds of Kaluli people in Papua New Guinea.

TOWARD AN ACOUSTEMOLOGY

If, in perceiving, "our whole body vibrates in unison with the stimulus...[then] hearing is, like all sense perception, a way of seizing reality with all our body, including our bones and viscera" (Gonzalez-Crussi 1989:45; compare Idhe 1976:81 and Ackerman 1990:186-90 on ways

sound penetrates the body). Sound, hearing, and voice mark a special bodily nexus for sensation and emotion because of their coordination of brain, nervous system, head, ear, chest, muscles, respiration, and breathing. "The vocal mechanism involves the coordinated action of many muscles, organs and other structures in the abdomen, chest, throat and head. Indeed, virtually the entire body influences the sound of the voice either directly or indirectly" (Sataloff 1992:108). Moreover, hearing and voice are connected by auditory feedback and by physical resonance, the immediate experience of one's presence through the echo-chamber of own voice. By bringing a durative, motional world of time and space simultaneously to front and back, top and bottom, and left and right, an alignment suffuses the entire fixed or moving body. This is why hearing and voicing link the felt sensations of sound and balance to those of physical and emotional presence.

This position problematizes Abu-Lughod and Lutz's argument that "emotion can be studied as embodied only after its social and cultural—its discursive—character has been fully accepted" (1990:13). Although they assert that "as cultural products [emotions] are reproduced in individuals in the form of embodied experience" (1990:12), it seems unwise to abstract discourse, or the production and circulation of topics through speech styles and genres, from the embodied voice, the site of verbal articulation, the resounding place of discourse as fully feelingful habits. Emotions may be created in discourse, but this social creation is contingent on performance, which is always emergent through embodied voices (see Urban 1991:148–71).

Acoustemology, acousteme: I am adding to the vocabulary of sensorial-sonic studies to argue the potential of acoustic knowing, of sounding as a condition of and for knowing, of sonic presence and awareness as potent shaping forces in how people make sense of experiences. Acoustemology means an exploration of sonic sensibilities, specifically of ways in which sound is central to making sense, to knowing, to experiential truth. This seems particularly relevant to understanding the interplay of sound and felt balance in the sense and sensuality of emplacement, of making place. For places are as potentially reverberant as they are reflective, and one's embodied experiences and memories of them may draw significantly on the interplay of that resoundingness and reflectiveness.

Acoustemology means that as a sensual space-time, the experience of place potentially can always be grounded in an acoustic dimension. This is so because space indexes the distribution of sounds, and time indexes the motion of sounds. Yet acoustic time is always spatialized; sounds are sensed as connecting points up and down, in and out, echo and reverb,

point-source and diffuse. And acoustic space is likewise temporalized; sounds are heard moving, locating, placing points in time. The placing of auditory time is the sonic envelope created from the layered attack, sustain, decay, and resonance of sounds. The placing of auditory space is the dispersion of sonic height, depth, and directionality. Space-time inevitably sounds in and as figure and ground, as comingness and goingness. Its presence is forward, backward, side to side, and is heard in trajectories of ascent, descent, arch, level, or undulation. What these rather abstract formulations suggest, in simple terms, is that experiencing and knowing place—the idea of place as sensed, place as sensation—can proceed through a complex interplay of the auditory and the visual, as well as through other intersensory perceptual processes.

BOSAVI ACOUSTEMOLOGY: BODILY UNITY OF ENVIRONMENT, SENSES, AND ARTS

acute hearing for locational orientation. Whether it is used in marked on ethnographers who have worked in the area (e.g., Feld 1990; E. L. presences of forest places are sonically announced even when visually are revealed only by the presence of a singing or speaking voice, so the monial dancers, or those of spirit mediums performing in total darkness, on me by analogy. He said that just as the identities of costumed ceresound cannot be hidden. A Kaluli man named Jubi once impressed this with vision. This is because much of the forest is visually hidden, whereas is always in interplay with other senses, particularly in a tense dialectic from vision, in both variety and salience. Even though one quickly realable from sound in this environment often greatly exceeds that available bush from inside a village longhouse, the locational information availwalking along forest trails or attending to the details of the surrounding forest activities such as hunting by sound or in mundane ones such as Schieffelin 1976; Sørum 1989; Weiner 1991). Kaluli commonly develop tants through hearing, listening, and voicing has strongly impressed itself nificant in the tropical forest, and the bodily orientation of its inhabipeople hear much that they do not see. The diffuseness of sound is sigand in the surrounding rainforest region of Papua New Guinea, Kaluli izes that hearing is the most culturally attuned sense in Bosavi, audition In common with their rainforest neighbors on the Great Papuan Plateau

Acoustic revelatory presence is thus always in tension with visual hidden presence in primal experiences of the forest. Linking experience and expression, this same tension adheres in Kaluli poetic concepts—for example, the intersensory desire to interpret songs, conversations,

arguments, or stories by "turning over" (balema) their surfaces to reveal their heg, "underneath," or sa, "inside." Turned over insides and underneaths reveal the resonant depths, meanings, subtleties, and implications of sounds, song poetics, stories, allegorical speeches, or dance costumes, just as they reveal the hidden presences of forest locales—the significance of the way places are physically shaped, such as the way rocks, waterfalls, mountains, or creeks emerge as presences with meaningful "inside" and "underneath" pasts. Thus the commonplace notion that objects and events are always more than they appear to be takes on a particularly sential and poetic character when it comes to Kaluli modes of interpreting the depths and dimensions of local experience.

Another way the Kaluli dialectic between what is hidden and what is revealed emerges is powerfully signaled by the intersensory iconic mama, "reflection" or "reverberation." Mama is one's image in water or in the mirror; it is the close-up reflection of oneself in the eyeball of another, the visual presence of the self apart from the self. It is also the lingering audio fragment of a decaying sound, its projection outward as it resounds by vanishing upward in the forest. Like the fading sharpness of a mirror image, mama is the trace of audio memory, fragmentary sonic remembrances as they reverberate. And ane mama, a "gone reflection-reverberation," is a spirit, a human absence returning in imagined (often avian) presence. Announced by flashes of sight or, more typically, by conspicuous sounds experienced without the accompaniment of a corresponding visual image, an ane mama presence instantly stimulates feelingful memories.

ence and memory of sago-place presence is deeply multisensory. Simiwithout smelling the aroma of fresh or rotting sago pith; the experihard to imagine the trickling of a shallow creek at a stand of sago palms sual to smell. Any number of everyday examples could be cited. It is ally continuous with smoky aromas that fires or resin torches release into the misting light rains and insects and frogs of the nearby bush, is sensularly, the dense sensuality of evening darkness, with voices overlapping of "hearing the odor." The metaphoric potential here inversely plays on fore the verb, such that the action of smelling carries the linguistic feel absorption or taking in; smelling requires marking the odor's name beear and nose. Hearing is the unmarked form, the major kind of sensory are incorporated into the same Bosavi verb, dabuma, or absorption by diffuseness of this motional sensorium, the processes of sound and smell the longhouse and diffuse out into the ever-moist night air. Evoking the long been absorbed as the "perfume of hearing" (Ackerman 1990:202) the familiar Western synesthetic notion that the pleasures of music have These Kaluli vision-sound interplays are also locationally intersen-

is suggested by the complexities of everyday practices linking sensory and choreographic media. These practices are encompassed in discourse and a:ba:lan, "flow." Both are important to Kaluli experience and expersed the sense only briefly and then concentrate on flow flow connecting the interrelated sense and sense only briefly and then concentrate on flow. Flow connecting landforms, as well as the voice flowing through and connecting grip, of sound and poetic song, the resounding propersion of the sense only briefly and then concentrate on flow. Flow concentrate defining the thinking, moving, feeling body. It also concerns the hold, the silent memory. These notions of flow all merge in the performance of the path maps that are a central feature of poetic song texts.

"Lift-up-over sounding" is the metaphoric construct that prescribes and describes natural sonic form for Kaluli people. Calling attention to both the spatial ("lift-up-over") and temporal ("sounding") axes of exof prior and contiguous sounds. When applied to the sound world of the rainforest, "lift-up-over sounding" highlights the observation that an interlocking soundscape. Forest sounds constantly shift figure and is completely interlocked and seamless. One hears no unison in nature. coordinate space as intersecting upward and outward. Sounds constantly to stand out from the others, while at the same time conveying the sense of sout that any primacy is fluid, as quickly lost as it is gained.

In the tropical rainforest, height and depth of sound are easily conent vegetation densities and with ever-present sounds such as the hiss of outward, dissipating as it moves. "Lift-up-over sounding" precisely yet cally, and sensually projects a space-time: upward feels like outward. This day, season of year, and placement in physical space through the sensual world is internalized as bodily knowledge, part of the everyday "body (Mauss 1979 [1935]) basic to routine Kaluli encounters in their world.

Kaluli transform these everyday encounters with acoustic figuregrounds, extending their naturalness from the experience of the rainforest soundscape to their own vocal and instrumental music. Voices and
sounds of drums and work tools are made to "lift-up-over" like the trees of the forest canopy;
waterfalls into swirling waterpools. These ideas are elaborated by Kaluli
sounding that always avoids unison. To create a "lift-up-over sounding,"
To be in synchrony means that the overall feeling is one of togetherness,
of consistently cohesive part coordination in sonic motion and particidifferent and shifting points of the same cycle or phrase structure at any
in degree of displacement from a hypothetical unison.

Additionally, "lift-up-over sounding" is created in timbre, by textural densification through a layering of attacks, decays, and fades, of play-ful accelerations, lengthenings, and shortenings, of the fission and fusion of sound shapes and phrases. Musical parts that interlock, alternate, or overlap create a form of participation that blurs competition and coperation, mirroring the larger Kaluli tendency toward tense egalitarianism in social activities ranging from speech and work to negotiation,

In concert with these dimensions of musical creativity, face-painting styles visually mirror sonic "lift-up-over sounding" through a parallel figure and ground principle in the texture contrast between shiny and further exploit textural densification by mixing many types of materishells, woven bands, bamboo, rattles, palm streamers, and colorful leaves. As the ceremonial dancer bobs up and down in this paraphernalia, layers streamers in motion, "lifted-up-over" by his drum, rattle, or voice.

Taking in nature, music, body painting, costume, and choreography, "lift-up over sounding" metaphorically unites Kaluli environment, senses, and arts. In complementary ways, the notion of a:ba:lan, "flow," similarly pervades and unites experiential realities of place to its expressive evocation. To illustrate how this happens, I turn first to the routine ways in which Kaluli people encounter, sense, and name places in their world, and then to the ways this flow of world sensing turns into a sensual poesis of place.

FROM SENSATION TO NAMING: PLACING PATHS OF FLOW IN KALULI EVERYDAY EXPERIENCE

The importance of place and placenames to Kaluli everyday experience, discourse, and ritual expression has been a long-standing issue in the ethnographic and linguistic research that my colleagues and I have undertaken in Bosavi since 1966. Edward L. Schieffelin's first work recognized the primacy of Kaluli identification with locality:

The identity of each longhouse community is not primarily associated with the clan membership of the people who inhabit the a [longhouse]. Rather, over a period of time the community becomes bound up with the area it moves about in and comes to be referred to by the name of the locality. Thus for example, lineages of Gasumisi and Wabisi whose communities' successive longhouses have been located in the vicinity of Bagolo Ridge are called Bagolo people. (1976:41)

Moreover,

place names, including that of the longhouse vicinity, refer to familiar forested ridges, streams that are full of fish, house sites and sago stands where a person has lived most of his life. . . . These places are meaningful because they mark the contexts of one's past experience. Kaluli identify themselves with place names because they see themselves reflected in their lands. (E. L. Schieffelin 1976:44–45)

Bambi B. Schieffelin's discourse-centered ethnography of Kaluli socialization (1979, 1986, 1990; Ochs and Schieffelin 1983, 1984) has not focused thematically on place, but her transcripts of everyday Kaluli family interactions indicate the prominence of place and travel as conversation topics in the circulation of talk about family history, movement, and work activity. Of particular interest is her discovery of how everyday family discourse involves a report citation form in which placenames are preceded by the third-person possessive marker and followed by a verb of staying—for example, ene Bolekini sah, "s/he's at her/his Bolekini" (B. B. Schieffelin, personal communication 1990). This form routinely ties place to person, identity to locality, and heightens the affective resonance of placenames. Its prominence in caregiver-child interactions underscores the biographical sense of place Kaluli children are socialized to assume.

My own work on Kaluli poetics (Feld 1990) has concentrated on the ways sequential citation of placenames in texts of song and lament construct improvised or composed maps that evoke memories of events, times, and social relations. The idea of a *tok*, or "path," emerged as one of the key devices of song composition and performance, and my Kaluli

teachers made me well aware of how much the emotional and memorial power of songs depended on their placename sequences. Continuing research reveals how invocation of the notion of tok signals a generic set of assumptions about the connectedness of Bosavi places, and with that connectedness, a connectedness of people, experiences, and memories. Tok signifies path, passage, canal, a nondirectional entry and exit, an opening in the sense of road, trail, or track. Connection as tok involves multiple images: a string of localities, contiguities and continuities of marked space, temporal progression from one place to another. The concept thus grounds the boundedness of places in the E.

cially food and talk. and cutting firewood, gathering water for drinking and cooking, making sweet potato gardens, and cooking, distributing and sharing food. All and repairing net bags, sharpening knives and axes, making and repaircommunity and its surroundings: socializing at the longhouse, gathering with others and time alone, time crossing the numerous brooks, streams, these activities bring Kaluli people together to share and exchange, espeplanting, weeding, and tending banana, pandanus, vegetable, fruit, and ing clothing, tending pigs, making fences, hunting and fishing, cutting, But Kaluli life also involves daily activities in the immediate longhouse creeks, and rivers that section all lands in the Bosavi rainforest region. time walking on trails, time traversing places both familiar and new, time places, or other longhouse communities. Time traveling always means travel to and from their home longhouse area, going to gardens, sago grounds the boundedness of places in the figure of their connectedness. Tok are regularly placed in everyday experiences as Kaluli people

Indeed, one could say that almost every Kaluli social activity is co-constituted in action and talk, and one certainly doesn't get far listening to Kaluli talk without hearing about places. More formal discourse modes, including stories, arguments, negotiations, laments, and songs, equally participate in this pattern, validating the centrality of place to experiential exchange and memory. Central to all this talk is place-naming practices. At the most basic lexical and semantic levels, these practices indicate the perceptual salience of demarcating an exceptionally varied geography, one experienced by engaging with sensual continuities and discontinuities in the surrounding rainforest environment.

Whether a descriptive recounting or a prescriptive instruction, whether talk of home, of the world within reach, of a journey, or of travel, every naming practice involves path making through a coreferencing of specific placenames (henceforth PN) with a generic terminology of place forms. The most basic place form distinction is between hen, "land," and ho:n, "water." These are named and cited with hena: wi, "land names," and ho:na: wi, "water names." But the distinction fuses as

much as it distinguishes dimensions of place, because everyday experience in Bosavi always involves a coordinated intermeshing of named lands and waters.

This coordination is well indicated by the subtleties of the most generic names for place forms. For instance, the two most significant types of land formations are fele and do:m. The term fele is related to the word off and downward to either side—what Australian bushwalkers, in an instructive metaphoric contrast, refer to as a "saddle" of land. Fele, which from an ascent and lead to a descent at either end. Those conjoined segments of ascent, descent, and roll-off in the land are its "sides," or do:m. the sides. Do:m has the same phonological shape as the word for "body" and discourse-in-context evidence leads me to believe that the image of for Kaluli speakers.

In any case, fele and do:m are hardly experienced autonomously as interconnected land formations. They are inseparable from the equally prevalent but far more sensuous presence of waterways. Walking a do:m implies a body of water below; once it is crossed, there is another do:m to climb on the other side. And fele implies one and usually more water eleb lying off and below to either of its sides. Eleb refers to the place in an ascending or arching elevation where creek water stops. Kaluli paraphrase this as the "head" of the water and say that water "sleeps going down down, typically flowing downstream from its slightly elevated "head." Another local paraphrase says that like a person standing upright, water stops and orients up to its "head."

In fact, water stops by moving along the do:m, up toward the fele. Following the local idiom, Kaluli guides are apt to point out that the eleb is not on the fele but in the do:m. This is another way of saying that the flows. But this embodied imagination goes farther still, for as these primal landforms are connected like thighs to the body, so the passage of water through them flows like the motion of voice. Voice flows by recontiguous physical segments, resonating so as to sensually link and stress ply connected, always multiply present across and along a variety of relaplost.

tively distinct, contiguous landforms, linking them and revealing their wholeness.

It is worth inserting here that aside from the obvious correspondences between the forms designated hen, "land," and ho:n, "water," in Kaluli and English, there are considerable difficulties both in linguistically glossing and in paraphrastically evoking much sense of the distinctness and interconnectedness of do:m, fele, and eleb as either bodily or landscape images. Names like these three inevitably seem far more abstract when one reads about them in English than they must feel to Kaluli people, who experience them directly as signs of the sensual obviousness of place. Part of the difficulty of grasping them comes from the clear lack of visual correspondence between these Bosavi rainforest forms and ones more experientially familiar to Westerners. For while do:m are relatively hilly and chestlike, and fele relatively flatter and thighlike, these terms do not really mean "hill" and "flatland" in the sense of the English terms, any nore than eleb exactly signifies the "head" or the "end" of a small creek.

of knowing, is critical to a Kaluli acoustemology, a sonic epistemology are diminishing or augmenting in and out of presence. This sensuality of of emplacement. locating and placing, along with its kinesthetic-sonesthetic bodily basis above, below, ahead, behind, or to the sides and whether these waterways mud on the feet are central to orienting onself in visually dense places. wetness in the air and the slick, slippery feel of different thicknesses of Additionally, one simultaneously hears what kinds of water presences are the sides. The land is virtually always wet from rain, so the presence of the land ahead is relatively flatter or hillier than the land behind or to est, Kaluli acutely attend to the heights, depths, and densities around than through visual ones. That is, they principally feel and hear whether their tracks through foot- and ear-felt indicators as much if not more by the moving, sensing, experiencing body. Surrounded by dense forthe kinesthesia and sonesthesia of shaped place, encountered and learned multisensual way by the coordination of walking, seeing, and hearingexperienced and distinguished less as purely visual forms and more in a An additional part the problem here is that do:m, fele, and eleb are

GENERIC PLACES AND PLACING

To continue with generic processes, land and water names often take the form of a specific placename plus a descriptive modifier that specifies the place form (henceforth PN + _____). Although the specific placename can stand alone, as can the descriptive modifier (as an abstract noun), they usually are combined. To take the most generic instances, one often

hears places cited as PN + do:m, or PN + fele, or PN + eleb. In the larger sentential discourse setting, these combinatorial sets may be further enhanced and illuminated by immediately conjoined locative and deictic particles, some of which encode directionality as specifically up, down, above, below, behind, or across. These and additional emphatic and paralinguistic markers all indicate aspects of the direction, elevation, density, and depth of land or water, as well as its experiential and evidential obviousness—for example, whether it is in or out of sight or audition.

Other terms that distinguish significant patterns in land formations are cited as PN + dugu, for the foothill area or the lower part of a hill or mountain; PN + misiyo:, for a high place rising from a do:m; PN + dagon, for a visually distinct mountain site or peak; PN + kugun, for a valleylike area of uncut forest flattening off by the side of a hill or mountain; PN + bulo, an obviously flat segment of land on a fele. Additionally, the same placename can be attached to several different descriptive modifiers to indicate ways in which a large stretch of land connects to a diversity of specific forms. Several discontinuous places on the same land can have the same PN + form designation, further emphasizing the complexity of abstractly reckoning land strictly through naming.

Other familiar anchors in place terminology indicate lands cleared for living spaces. These include PN + ba or ba-daido:; a clearing or degrassed clearing, implying the presence of a main longhouse opening onto a cleared yard. This clearing would be connected outward to forest, gardens, and sago areas by customary trails of several different sizes and use patterns, ranging from the ten-foot-wide intervillage tracks (gamane tok or dalaka, from English "track," for government road) that signal intensified contact and government presence in the area since the 1960s to the small forest clearing or mud-and-vine trail openings into the forest whose pig or human footprints indicate customary daily travels. These types of tracks lead beyond living, gardening, or familial arenas to forest places progressively usa, "within," or heno: usa, "within the land." They lead away from villages and larger trails toward ilabode, "bush," deep in the forests.

Places are explicitly connected as paths by PN + tok, or by attaching a specific placename to a path descriptive like soso:go:f, the point where two trails come together, thus locating a place by means of its entry or exit point. Talk about paths also indicates qualities such as how "straight" (digalo:), "bending" (koagelo:), or completely "meandering" or bending back on itself (sisiali) a trail might be, as well as how it might be distinguished by characteristics of forest vegetation or density.

Similarly, land names are made more distinct by markers indicating human impacts. Names attach to swidden garden sites as PN + ikuwo: or

PN + egelo: (literally "tree-cut" or "plant-planted"), as well as to garden qualities. For example, PN + asak indicates a garden edge with planted ridge on the top. PN + ikuwo:sak ("tree-cut" + asak) indicates the appearance of a double ridge with some trees cut and some left above; hence the appearance of two canopy layers, the lower layer regrown on a hill and the upper layer including original growth on a ridge.

Places where sago palms grow, are felled, and are processed into the staple starch of the Kaluli diet further link human impacts to land tracks and to waterways, particularly small creeks and streams. Sago places are noted as PN + ma:n kuwo: ("sago-cut"), and the placename can equally mark the adjacent land or waterway. Like the centrality of longhouse site names in creating the merged time and space of a community, human presence is always relational to named gardens and sago places and thus central to the identity of those who work and live nearby. Memories—of food, work, labor assistance—are magnetized to those names, making place a fused locus of time and space.

VATER

as well, like ho:n-si, a little spring hole where one draws drinking water. no pool, just water flowing downstream. There are specific water forms a creek or river, the edge of water. Waterways are further demarcated as sisiali, curved, crooked, or meandering, with constant bends, or tili, with depression or minor pool where water slows; and PN + sa:, the "bank" of gressive space-time of day and season. In addition to the terms ho:n and and immediacy comprise a multiplicity of subtly differentiated presences a seemingly constant hiss, water's ever-present varieties of sonic volume "downstream"; PN + mogan, "deep waterpool"; PN + bese, a "recess," a mensions and segments encountered every day. These include PN + kinieleb, numerous other descriptives indicate the variety of waterway di-These are instantly felt and interpreted by Kaluli as indexes of the proweather patterns, swelling and resounding with every day's rains. At first The acoustic presence of water changes constantly through the seasonal through places, linking and demarcating them throughout the forest presence as well, a depth and dimensionality of presence as it travels Always heard even when it cannot be seen, water has dramatic visual

The two most significant waterway forms besides *eleb* are those that link waterways together and mark significant boundaries or land elevation changes. Water PN + *so:k* marks a "conjunction," a place where two waters come together, and water PN + *sa* indicates a "waterfall." Because water conjunctions and waterfalls mark boundaries that coordinate land and water forms, they are additionally important for demarcating fishing areas, boundaries, and rights. Waterfall segments themselves are further

marked for both their contour in the surrounding land and their impact on shaping the water below—for instance, water PN + sa-wel, "waterfall crest" or ledge; water PN + sa-mi, a "waterfall drop-off" or break point; water PN + sa-mogan, a "deep waterpool" at the base of a waterfall; water PN + sa-ko:f, where water breaks off a mogan beneath the fall; and water PN + sa-ga, where water rejoins after a split below the fall.

Other ways in which downstream waterways are co-referenced with landforms include water PN + da:l, where a water section opens up to flow from a cleared gap; PN + du, marking a land or rock bank between two segments of the same waterway; and PN + min, where one water breaks into two to rejoin later. When two creeks run roughly parallel over a long stretch of land, thus coordinating land and water features, they are termed ida:ni galiali, "two of them lying/staying together."

But the sensual primacy of water emerges in Kaluli naming practices in another way, namely, through the descriptive prominence of onomatopoeic ideophones for water sound and motion. While these ideophones are common in talk about waterways, they only rarely substitute for either specific water names or for water descriptives. Six iconic patterns convey the sound sensations of the basic water motions:

taling bu, bulu, gu, gulu, guluqulu, gululu "spraying" fu, fuga, fuwa:n
"flowing hard/fast" fo, foo, oo
"flowing light/slow" tin, tintin, tiya, tiyatiya
"swirling" go, gogo, golo, gologolo, gololo
"splashing/plunging" kubu, kubukubu, tubu, tubutubu

Further extensions of these terms use lengthened vowels to iconically mark durative intensity, or syllabic reduplication to iconically mark durative continuity. Additionally, ideophones can attach to regular verbal morphology in talk, as well as attach to special poetically marked aspectual morphology in songs. In a few cases, placenames actually incorporate these sonic ideophones. The waterfall named Gulusa (the sa of an iconically named creek, the Gulu) is formed from gulu + sa, "downward falling water sound" + "waterfall." Bulusami, the place where the Bulu creek (again, the name is ideophonic) joins the Gamo river below a large waterfall and waterpool, is formed from Bulu + sa-mi, Bulu creek + "waterfall-drop edge," literally, "sound of loud, downward rolling water sound" + "drop place." In these examples the evocative powers of ideophonic expression emplace the direct relationship of sound to sense in the voice, forcefully linking everyday sensual experience to the aesthetic depths of poesis.

LAND AS WATER AS LAND

In The Sorrow of the Lonely and the Burning of the Dancers, Edward L. Schieffelin notes the connectedness of Bosavi lands and waters:

Most places in the forest are named after the stream that gives the land its contours in that vicinity. . . . The waters, as they turn and fall, generate new localities for every new configuration of the land. The name of a locality carries, in effect, its own geographical coordinates, which place it in determinate relation to the brooks and streams that flow through the forest. (1976:30)

Hence, the experience and naming of Bosavi lands and waters is always interpenetrated. This is most forcefully indicated by the flexibility of attaching landform descriptive modifiers to specific water names and water-form modifiers to specific land names.

well as a downstream (Sulu kini), a waterfall (Sulu sa, Sulu sa-wel), and a a creek, with named places along its banks where there are varieties of of Bono: cleared land and built their longhouses in the 1960s, 1970s, a creek named Sulu is not just an abstract watercourse but one whose running along large stretches of land. In the community I know best, tween specific and general, personal and social, momentary and historisago palms and named waterpools (Sulu mogan) and dips (Sulu bese), as people). At the same time, everyone knows that Sulu is quite explicitly the primary referent for people who live there (Sululeb kalu, Sululeb and early 1980s, Sululeb is also a longhouse site name and, by extension, And because the hill just beyond this particular place is where members head, it is equally a name for the arch of land where the Sulu stream ends. path connects to lands named Sulu do:mo: and Sulu fele. Moreover, even they consummate in place. cal resonances for these names, along with the time-space connections junction (Sulu so:k). What this example indicates is the constant play bethough Sululeb (Sulu + eleb) marks where the Sulu creek comes to a Primary examples of this process derive from the many small creeks

PLACENAMES, LINGUISTIC REFERENCE, AND MEMORIAL INDETERMINACY

The formula "PN + form descriptive" names and thereby implements everyday emplacement, anchoring everyday talk descriptions of where one is, has been, or is going. Additionally, tendencies in the formation of placenames hold important potentials related to memory and biography. For the Kaluli, as for the neighboring Foi, "place names act as mnemonics for the historical actions of humans that make places singular and significant" (Weiner 1991:45). Some placenames serve forcefully as shorthands, encapsulating stories about historical or mythical events whose magnitudes vary from mundane to cosmic. Some Bosavi places, for example, are named in relation to mythic origins or events responsible for

establishing taboos. Others are directly constructed as primal sources of spiritual or supernatural power, and stories are attached to these placenamnes to indicate why the place is avoided in sight or visitation or why create resentments or offend mythocosmic beings. Some of these matters are revealed in stories that are variably well known or quite esoteric; spirit-medium seances (E. L. Schieffelin 1976:29–45, 1977, 1984, 1985; Schieffelin and Crittenden 1991:58–87; Schieffelin and Kurita 1988).

At the simplest level, name structure itself points toward layers of reflew the pattern seen in the placename Hinibululo:wo:, which is formed from him + bulu + lo:wo:, literally, "earthquake" + "broke open" + nominal, meaning "place where earthquake broke open the ground there." The place referred to is a dramatically visual and unusual landform, and of current historical memory. Because the place in question now follows of Suguniga, there is a clear linkage between the referential semantics of the placename, an event, a placed landform, and stories that are important to the history of a specific community and its members.

Yet semantically bundled placename packages like this one are relatively rare in the Bosavi language. Far more prevalent among names with some overt referential distinctiveness are ones taken to be related to an are quite important in local community history. For example, while and Baoho:mo:no: The first is formed from bao + a + misa:n, signify-that is, "longhouse site where people lived during a bao a." The second, monial hunting lodge" + "water" + "ho:n + mo:no:, signifying interest is formed from bao + ho:n + mo:no:, signifying cereduring time of holding a bao a."

The bao a was a male ceremonial lodge and a period of seclusion, hunting, esoteric instruction, and homosexual liaisons between men and the simultaneous threat to secrecy and call for labor when missionarand Baoho:mo: are close to a place named Wogole, the site of the last since the last bao a was held in Bosavi and thirty-five years since the last bao a was held in Bosavi and stories connected with this institution shift considerably in the living population. Names like Baoamisa:n

and Baoho:mo:no: are thus explicit reminders of past presences and activities to which members of Bono: or other communities have varying degrees of linkage or distance according to age, gender, and knowledge of esoteric cultural practices. The names thus ring variably transparent or deep, and lead to stories variably shallow or dense.

ago, having left Muluma, staying here by the Yolo he built a big house, named Gaso, Wasoba's father's father, a man of clan Wabisi, well, long neath," a heg or "reason" for the name, and as I switched on my cassette built a large village longhouse." I then asked if there was an "undera man's name, plus "main village longhouse," or the "place where Gaso convention), that the place was called Gasoamisa:n. This was instantly with a sweeping, nose-pointing deixis (another bodily placing-spacing later he quit it, left to stay at Nageba:da:n, that's all." recorder Ayasilo remarked (in Kaluli, rather literally translated), "A man regional resonances. For example, one morning in July 1992, Ayasilo and recognizable as a name formed from Gaso + a + misa:n, that is, Gaso, name of the hill arching above along the left side of the track. He replied, house site of Sululeb. As we crossed the Yolo creek I asked him the land were walking on the government track past the former Bono: longbiographical or historical stories that have complexly varied personal or More typical yet are names whose referential potential opens out to

space must be seen as dimensions of a unified space-time percept." a man's personal memory, to the people of the former longhouse com-Time is located as an immanent part of the topography. . . . time and seen as objectivated through this practice. The landscape is also history rality is usually concretized by location, and phenomena of time may be cal, historical, and regional memories are thus encapsulated in and unto that clan and the surrounding community, to the creek we were just with the neighboring Bedamini described by Sørum (1989:4), "tempoidentity is emplaced and how places are central to personal identities. As leashed by the name Gasoamisa:n, reciprocally indicating how personal history of fission and fusion with Ayasilo's own. Biographical, geographimunity of Sululeb, and to another longhouse community involved in a then crossing, to a defining act marking significance and boldness around clan, to a land name of central historical and contemporary importance eration from their longhouse community; he is also linked to a specific Gaso is generationally linked to an elder man of Ayasilo's father's genrable feature of his life are narratively located in a placed space-time. it is striking to notice how quickly and thoroughly a person and a memo-Despite the contextual artificiality (i.e., a direct question elicitation),

Sometimes name structures are referentially descriptive of a land formation alone. In these cases the significance of the name is transparent at one level but in no way obvious at others. For example, Walaheg is