

UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DA BAHIA
ESCOLA DE MÚSICA – PROGRAMA DE PÓS-GRADUAÇÃO EM MÚSICA
PROPOSTA DE SEMINÁRIO: PERSPECTIVAS DE PESQUISA EM ANÁLISE MUSICAL
DOCENTE: PROF. DR. PAULO COSTA LIMA
www.paulolima.ufba.br

“A análise musical pode ser vista como uma espécie de construção de modelos, uma atividade seletiva pela própria natureza e, conseqüentemente, propositadamente, deformadora do todo, conduzindo ao estudo de certas propriedades em isolamento de seu contexto de origem. Não se pode esperar de nenhuma abordagem ou enfoque analítico específico que revele todas as propriedades significativas de uma obra, uma vez que tais resultados seriam incompatíveis com o processo analítico em si”. David Epstein (1979, p. 12)

“Música pode ser o que pensamos que seja: ou pode não ser. Música pode ser sentimento, sensação, sensualidade, mas também pode não ter nada a ver com emoção ou sensação física. Música pode ser aquilo para o qual alguns dançam ou fazem amor; mas, tal não é necessariamente o caso. Em algumas culturas há categorias complexas para pensar sobre música; em outras, parece nem haver a necessidade de especular sobre música, contemplando-a. O que música é, permanece aberto a questionamento em todos os tempos e lugares. Tal sendo o caso, qualquer metafísica da música precisa necessariamente separar o resto do mundo de um tempo e espaço privilegiado, um tempo e espaço pensado como próprio. Pensar sobre música, portanto, é na verdade, em sua base, uma tentativa de proclamar a música como sendo nossa, controlando-a.” Philip V. Bohlman (1999, p. 1)

1. Ementa

Seminário voltado para a discussão de temas relevantes no cenário atual da pesquisa em análise musical, buscando desenvolver uma visão abrangente e contemporânea do campo, e ao mesmo tempo incitando a escolha de áreas específicas para aprofundamento por cada participante. Pressupõe alguma familiaridade com a tradição analítica — histórico/estilística e formal/descritiva —, e busca elaborar um entendimento sobre a natureza das construções teóricas e analíticas, implicando o reconhecimento do processo de diversificação de enfoques.

2. Objetivos

- . propiciar o confronto com a literatura analítica recente, enfatizando sua diversidade.
- . valorizar um estilo de leitura questionador e proativo
- . estimular a construção de argumentações - orais e escritas
- . favorecer o desenvolvimento de conexões entre os horizontes de pesquisa dos participantes e o corpo da literatura.

3. Justificativa

O campo da análise musical vive um saudável momento de abertura de perspectivas, ocupando dessa forma, no âmbito da musicologia, um papel de destaque como potencializador de interações com territórios disciplinares os mais diversos - psicologia, filosofia, antropologia, lingüística, semiótica, sociologia, matemática, ciência da computação etc. - sem perder de vista a possibilidade de construção de um discurso centrado sobre a própria vivência artística.

Nos últimos anos houve uma nítida reação a um enclausuramento anterior da atividade analítica, no âmbito das chamadas ‘concepções estruturalistas’ – algo que ganhou a denominação de paradigma estrutural-organicista – dando origem a uma busca de enfoques capazes de dar conta dos novos desafios, enfatizando agora a importância dos contextos de origem da obra de arte, do papel da intensa negociação entre as formações sociais, culturais e as soluções artísticas adotadas, sem, contudo, abrir mão do potencial de elaboração e de profundidade de discurso alcançado nas etapas anteriores.

O processo de consolidação da Pós-Graduação em música no Brasil vem dando origem a uma utilização crescente de técnicas analíticas como ferramentas de apoio para investigações em praticamente todas as sub-áreas - composição, práticas interpretativas, musicologia histórica, etnomusicologia. Encontramos, freqüentemente, problematizações calcadas sobre questões analíticas, metodologias que se apoiam sobre conceitos de análise musical, quando não, peças inteiras de trabalho acadêmico esculpidas através de ferramentas analíticas.

No entanto, essa presença constante da análise nas teses e dissertações não tem sido acompanhada de um investimento sistemático na direção da sofisticação das concepções analíticas utilizadas. Ainda é comum encontrar abordagens analíticas absolutamente tradicionais, inocentemente colocadas sem qualquer intuição da vastíssima literatura produzida na área nas últimas décadas.

Trata-se, portanto, de uma necessidade generalizada, a discussão e aprofundamento da ‘questão analítica’. O presente seminário pretende contribuir nessa direção através da exposição do aluno a uma variedade considerável de discursos analíticos, forçando uma consciência do papel interpretativo dessa atividade. Esse esforço de ampliação dos horizontes, deve ser seguido (em seminários subseqüentes) pela oferta da possibilidade de aprofundamento de alguns dos enfoques visitados (p.e teoria do ritmo, análise motívica, análise schenkeriana, teoria dos conjuntos etc.).

4. Procedimentos

4.1 Descrição do fluxo de atividades

Distribuição de textos e de exemplos analíticos propostos como estímulo para discussão e aprofundamento. Os textos são inicialmente introduzidos como ‘fragmentos’ sintéticos, os exemplos como ‘situações analíticas’ que remetem a uma série de horizontes temáticos, para os quais se pedem interpretações, justificativas e críticas, como se fossem janelas para universos analíticos distintos.

Ciclo de Atividades

1. Análise e discussão de ‘fragmentos’ de texto;
2. Análise e discussão de ‘situações analíticas’;
3. Preparação de um texto-resposta ao fragmento ou à situação analítica (assinalando os pilares conceituais e daí derivando questões);
4. Contextualização dos fragmentos e situações analíticas - leitura e comentário de alguns dos artigos originais (de onde vieram os fragmentos), e de literatura equivalente; apreciação das análises de onde surgiram as situações analíticas, busca de alternativas;
5. Preparação de lista de questões relevantes (desdobrando a lista de questões apresentadas como referência para a avaliação), capazes de abrigar os elementos apresentados pelos itens inspecionados (fragmentos, textos, situações analíticas e análises); transformação dessas questões em atividades de debate (metodologia do Grand-Juri), preparando-se ataque e defesa de determinadas posições;
6. Trabalho/Produto final – Elaboração de tema relacionado às propostas do seminário.

Todos os encontros incluirão apresentações dos participantes, envolvendo os cinco níveis acima descritos. Espera-se que cada estudante produza material de forma regular, apresentando-o ao grupo frequentemente.

4.2 Horizontes temáticos

1. Tradição analítica derivada de enfoques do século XIX e início do XX (enfoques histórico/estilístico e descritivo/formal)
2. Teoria do Ritmo/ Temporalidades / Teoria da forma
3. Teoria pós-tonal / Aplicações matemáticas / Análise via computador
4. Teoria motivica
5. Fenomenologia (Husserl-Clifton; Heidegger-Ferrara)
6. Música como símbolo/Semiologia/Semiótica/Narratividade/Música e texto
7. Análise Schenkeriana
8. Análise e Cognição

9. A dimensão social e política (teoria crítica; identidade; pertencimento)
10. Análise e Tradição oral / Análise e música popular / Métodos comparativos / Análise do estilo
11. Análise e Performance
12. Historiografia da Música / Teoria e História
13. Teoria da composição
14. Música e Psicanálise
15. Outros ângulos: música e filosofia, pós-modernismo, pós-colonialismo, gênero etc.
16. Análise abrangente do processo de construção teórica e analítica

17. Visitando a produção analítica brasileira (uma brevíssima incursão na realidade nacional)

4.3 Seqüência de Fragmentos

Bloco I

Autores	Linhas	Idéias e conceitos nucleares
1. Susan McClary (1993)	Teoria crítica	Análise: a) e códigos sociais; b) e ‘esquemas narrativos’; c) como ato político; d) e liberdade interpretativa
2. Bowman (1988)	Fenomenologia	a) música e corpo; b) ser e música; c) retorno à música em si; d) desvio criado pela análise tradicional; e) a experiência musical; f) novas categorias: tempo, espaço, play e feeling.
3. A. Schönberg (1995)	Teoria Motívica	a) problematização como modelo composicional (experimentalismo; linguagem e retórica; dialética); b) a função de contraste; c) conceituação de motivo
4. Gregory Karl	Narratividade	a) integração de aspectos estruturais e semântico-expressivos; b) elaboração de conceitos que possam funcionar em ambos os domínios; c) conceito de plot (trama musical).
5. Christopher Hasty(1997)	Teoria do Ritmo	a) dinâmica musical (versus estática); b) fluxo, articulação, regularidade, forma, proporção, repetição, padrão, gesto, animação e movimento; c) métrica, duração, proporções.
6. Charles Wuorinen(1979)	Teoria Pós-Tonal	a) sistema; b) método; c) operações; d) conjunto de elementos d) multi-dimensionalidade (superfície e background – em função de uma rede mais abstrata e genérica de relações de onde emergem os aspectos imediatos e locais).
7. Lydia Goehr (1992)	Filosofia/Música	a) conceito de obra-de-arte; b) visões: platônica, quasi-platônica, aristotélica, nominalista e idealista.
8. Robert Fink (1999)	Pós-modernismo	a) ‘profundidade’ como metáfora estruturalista; b) hierarquia e organicidade; c) exaltação pós-moderna da superfície; d) hierarquia como índice de valor em música contemporânea.

Bloco II

Autores	Linhas	Idéias e conceitos nucleares
9. Lerdahl e Jackendoff (1983)	Análise e Cognição	Teoria da música - descrição formal das ‘intuições’ de um ouvinte; interregno visão matemática e enfoques intuitivos.
10. Kevin Korsyn (1999)	Narratividade	Crítica ao binômio texto/contexto, sincronia versus diacronia, análise versus história; Intertextualidade
11. Leo Treitler (1999)	Historiografia	Perigos da contextualização excessiva e da escrita virtuosística (em história); a obra-de-arte autônoma como premissa.
12. Richard Sterba (1939)	Psicanálise	A Música e seus fundamentos instintuais narcísicos; conteúdo latente de uma obra-de-arte; música como ‘objectless art’
13. David Epstein (1999)	Sobre Schenker	Estrutura em perspectiva; relações de longo alcance; camadas; conceito de modulação
14. David Montgomery	Teoria motívica	Reconstruindo as origens do pensamento organicista na Europa do Século XIX; de Goethe a Schönberg
15. Nicholas Cook (1999)	Teoria / performance	A performance ‘iluminada’ pela estrutura (politicamente, ou, analiticamente correta); a análise iluminada pela performance
16. Otto Laske	Teoria-Composição	Teoria da composição como território da teoria da música; ‘example based’ versus ‘rule-based’ composition.

Bloco III

Autores	Linhas	Idéias e conceitos nucleares
17. Nicholas Cook	Métodos comparativos	O que tornaria uma análise genuinamente científica e objetiva?
18. Hans Keller (1979)	Teoria da composição	Natureza da lógica musical; tensão entre expectativas; imprevisibilidade;
19. Jonathan Kramer (1985)	Teoria do Ritmo	Linearidade versus não-linearidade; tipos de temporalidade em música.
20. Charles Wuorinen (1979)	Teoria da Forma	Dois grandes tendências formais: a justaposição (Stravinsky) e o desenvolvimento (Schönberg)
21. Kofi Agawu (1979)	Semiótica	Diversidade de parâmetros produzidos pela sub-área; não valida várias distinções tradicionais (leste-oeste); a identificação de unidades significantes...
22. Edward T. Cone	Teoria da Forma	Quais os princípios que governam o ordenamento e a hierarquização em música?
23. Didier-Weil	Psicanálise	A intraduzibilidade; o sujeito que diz 'sim' à música; a música como sujeito que ouve...
24. W. Bowman	Teoria crítica	Música como um modo de atividade humana, que se faz com ou para outras pessoas; a música não reflete a sociedade, ela é a sociedade em si.

Bloco IV

Autores	Linhas	Idéias e conceitos nucleares
25. Robert Gjerdingen (1999)	Análise e Cognição	Teoria da musica e experimento
26. Jean-Jacques Nattiez	Meta Análises	Análise como metalinguagem; seis situações analíticas
27. Bo Alphonse	Análise via computador	Programas para ler, analisar e descobrir padrões em composições musicais
28. Rudolph Reti	Teoria motivica	Crítica ferrenha ao enfoque retiano; parâmetros não contemplados.
29. Hundrun	Métodos comparativos	Auxiliar da pesquisa em musica, possibilitando a elaboracao de perguntas e respostas.
30. Susan McClary	Música Popular	A trajetória do Blues; e noção de pertencimento entre afro descendentes na América e entre jovens ingleses de classe média.
31. David Beach	Schenker/motivos	Concepcao schenkeriana de motivo
32. Philip Bohlman	Música e pertencimento	Ontologias da musica.

Bloco V - Fragmentos complementares

33. Adorno (1,24,30) – dialética entre material e sociedade
34. Ferrara (2, - outra versão da fenomenologia (e de Clifton)
35. Babbitt (3,6 ...)- o mundo dos hexacordes
36. Maus (4,21 ...) – música como narrativa
37. Rothstein (5,9,19...) – ritmo frasal
38. Joel Lester (11...) - teoria composicional do século XVIII
39. Dahlhaus (7,26...) – análise e estética
40. Clifton (2...) – fenomenologia aplicada, introdução.
41. Diana Deutsch (9,25...) – análise e cognição

4.3 Situações Analíticas Previstas (envolvendo exemplos de cada um dos horizontes)

1. J. Brahms, Sinfonia 3 - Análise de Susan McClary : self and difference, ambiguidade, etc.
2. B. Bartok, Improvisação 3, op.20- Análise de Ferrara: sound-in-time (fenomenologia)
3. W. A. Mozart, Quarteto K 465 – Análise de Schoenberg (Neff): motivo \ <i>liquidation</i>
4. Beethoven op. 57 Apassionata: Análise de Gregory Karl: plot – narratividade
5. Beethoven, Sinfonia 3 - Análise de Schenker: Ursatz
6. Mozart, Sinfonia 40 – 4º mov.– Análise de David Lewin : (GIS)
7. E. Widmer: Sonata op. 122 “Monte Pascoal”; Concerto op. 116; Ignis op. 102; 4 Estações do Sonho op. 129; – Análises de Paulo Costa Lima – motivo/conjunto
8. Mozart, Sinfonia 40 – 1º mov. – Análise de Reti e de Epstein (estrutura motívica)
9. Mozart, Sinfonia 40 – 1º mov. – Análise de Lerdahl e de Kramer (hypermeasures)
10. Schoenberg, op. 11 n.1 – Análises de Perle, Wittlich, Lima
11. L. Cardoso, Monódica – Análise de Alexandre Reche (teoria dos conjuntos)
12. F. Cerqueira, Rola Mundo – Análise de Ângelo Tavares
13. ‘God Save the King’ – Análise de Kofi Agawu : semiótica
14. Análises utilizadas como aplicações da teoria pós-tonal por Joseph Straus: Introduction to Post-Tonal Theory
15. Análises utilizadas como exemplo por Nicholas Cook em: <i>A Guide to Musical Analysis</i> .
16. H. Oswald , Il Neige, para piano solo
17. Análise sem palavras de Hans Keller
Outras situações

4.4 Exemplificação de ‘Plano de Aula’

PLANO DE AULA (1)

A. Roteiro de discussão e ‘spinning out’ do fragmento 1

(1) Autora : (Susan McClary)

1. Idéias nucleares: a) códigos sociais são variáveis relevantes para a análise; b) forma sonata e tonalidade devem ser pensados como ‘esquemas narrativos’; c) a análise como ato político; d) talvez a idéia mais forte esteja implícita (a liberdade interpretativa que o enfoque ensaia...)
2. Buscar associações e explicações para as seguintes expressões: ‘absolute music’ [Hanslick; teoria da forma; formalismo; music and rhetoric etc...]; ‘or even affect’ [música e afeto, música e semântica’ ...], ‘pitch centeredness’ [centricidade]
3. Que espécie de universo seria aberto pelo fragmento em questão? [teoria crítica e narratividade]
4. Que tipo de análise um enfoque tal como este produziria? [remete ao artigo sobre a *3ª Sinfonia de Brahms.*]
5. Discutir a noção apresentada de ‘protagonista’; a promessa de interação entre aspectos formais e sociais; o desejo ‘ambíguo’ de Brahms.
6. Agendar fichamento e apresentação do artigo para o encontro (2)

B. Situações Analíticas

1. 3ª Sinfonia de Brahms (antecipação dos problemas levantados por Susan McClary e ampliação)

C. Outros Links

1. Apresentação de referências bibliográficas complementares

D. Discussão do Fragmento (2)

(2) Autor: (Bowman sobre Clifton)

1. Idéias nucleares: a) música e corpo; b) ser e música; c) retorno à música em si; d) crítica ao desvio provocado pela análise tradicional (altura e intervalo tomados como fundamentais); e) a essência da experiência musical; f) as novas categorias: tempo, espaço, play e feeling.
 2. Associações: a que remete a expressão ‘prior understanding of motion in time, of toward and away from etc. ?; a que remete ‘bodily informed perspective’?
 3. Quais os contornos do universo analítico aberto por esse fragmento?
 4. Que espécie de análise um enfoque desse tipo produziria?
 5. Que bibliografia conhecem sobre o assunto?
- E. Exercício de Planejamento de Mesa Redonda em torno das temáticas levantadas pelo frag. 1.
- F. Apresentação individual e sucinta dos horizontes de pesquisa de cada participante.

4.5 Cronograma

Semin.	
1.	APC; DF [1,2]; BC; STA ; AS/TM/TR-1/TC (1)
2.	DF [3,4,5,6]; BC; STA; AS/TM/TR-1/TC (2)
3.	DF [7,8,9,10]; BC; STA; AS/TM/TR-1/TC (3)
4.	DF [11,12,13,14]; BC; STA; AS/TM/TR-1/TC (4)
5.	DF [15,16,17,18]; BC; STA; EA(1); AS/TM/TR-1/TC (5)
6.	DF [19,20,21,22]; BC; STA; EA(2); AS/TM/TR-1/TC (6)
7.	DF [23,24,25,26]; BC; STA; EA(3); AS/TM/TR-1/TC (7)
8.	DF [27,28,29,30,31]; BC; STA; EA(4); AS/TM/TR-1/TC (8); AG(1)
9.	DTF; STA; BC; IE (1); GJ (1)
10.	DTF; STA; IE(2); AS/TM/TR-1/TC (9)
11.	DTF; STA; BC/AB (1); GJ (2)
12.	DTF; STA; BC/AB(2); AS/TM/TR-1/TC (10); AG(2)
	Outros Encontros: Discussão de tópicos de interesse individual e orientação de TF

Siglas:

APC – Apresentação de proposta do curso

DF – Discussão de fragmentos

STA – Discussão de situação analítica

BC – Apresentação de bibliografia complementar

ES – Exercício de síntese

Exposições e Exemplificações

AS – Análise Schenkeriana

TM – Teoria motívica

TR – Teoria do ritmo

TC – Teoria dos conjuntos

EA – Enfoques alternativos

IE – Interação de enfoques (TC/TM; TR/AS etc)

Outras atividades:

DTF – Discussão da proposta de trabalho final

GJ – Grand-Juri analítico (defesa de posições antagônicas; ex. per/contra Reti, per/contra Schenker, per/contra ‘the new musicology’ etc.)

AB – Análise no Brasil

AG – Avaliação em Grupo (compartilhada)

4.6 Avaliação

A. Espera-se que o estudante, ao final do curso, possa responder e comentar de forma sucinta (porém adequada) as seguintes questões:

1. O que caracteriza a abordagem histórico-estilística em análise musical?
2. O que caracteriza a abordagem formal-descritiva?
3. O que é teoria do ritmo? Quais as principais áreas de investigação acionadas por essa corrente?
4. Quais as premissas que apoiam a teoria dos conjuntos? O que é ‘sistema musical’ e a que aparelho conceitual remete? Quais as principais áreas de pesquisa em análise de música atonal?
5. Qual a diferença entre a noção local de ‘motivo’, associada à contiguidade e às relações nota-a-nota, e o conceito de Grundgestalt (ou basic shape)?
6. Quais as (principais) características definidoras do enfoque schenkeriano?
7. Que relação pode ser estabelecida entre teoria da música e psicologia cognitiva?
8. Qual a crítica estabelecida pela corrente fenomenológica aos enfoques tradicionais? Quais os quatro conceitos básicos utilizados por Clifton?
9. O que é semiologia ou semiótica? Quais as implicações dos estudos semióticos para a área de análise musical?
10. O que é ‘musical plot’? Que outras idéias e conceitos aproximam a narratividade da teoria da música?
11. Qual o perfil da sub-área de teoria da performance?
12. Quais as perspectivas acionadas pela idéia de intertextualidade em teoria da música?
13. Quais as perspectivas implicadas na construção da noção de inconsciente em música?
14. Que visão propõe Nattiez no sentido de criar uma meta teoria da análise musical, identificando famílias de procedimentos analíticos?
15. O que dizer sobre a interação de vários enfoques numa mesma construção analítica? Por exemplo, quais os universos de referência utilizados por McClary em sua análise da 3ª Sinfonia de Brahms?
16. Do ponto de vista da teoria da música e da análise musical, que questões de interesse vem sendo apresentadas pelo trabalho empreendido como ‘filosofia da música’?
17. Que paralelo pode ser estabelecido entre o campo da história e da análise musical?
18. Como descrever de forma sucinta o campo de produção de análise musical via computador?
19. Comente as idéias básicas envolvidas no esforço da análise do estilo?
20. Como abordar uma possível definição de lógica musical? [Cf. Hans Keller]

21. Como as tendências analíticas enfocadas aparecem representadas na produção analítica brasileira atual?
22. Que autores e trabalhos constituem uma referência mínima para a literatura analítica no Brasil?

23. Demonstre saber como funciona uma análise orientada a partir das seguintes correntes:

schenkeriana	semiótica	teoria dos conjuntos	narratividade	teoria do ritmo
fenomenologia	teoria motívica	comparativa	teoria crítica	

B. Acompanhamento individualizado do trabalho de leituras realizadas, 6 artigos (avaliação do processo);

C. Apreciação do Trabalho Final.

BIBLIOGRAFIA

AGAWU, Kofi.

1996 "Analyzing music under the new musicological regime". *Music Theory Online*. Society for Music Theory. URL: <http://boethius.music.ucsb.edu/mto/issues/mto.96.2.4/mto.96.2.4.agawu.html>

1999 The Challenge of Semiotics, In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p. 138-160.

BENT, Ian D.

1980 "Analysis", In: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. London, Macmillan.

BENT, Ian D. e Anthony Pople

2000 "Analysis", In: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (2nd Ed.)*. London, Macmillan.

BOWMAN, Wayne

1998 *Philosophical Perspectives on Music*. Chapter 6: Music as Experienced. London, Oxford Univ. Press, p. 254-301.

COOK, Nicholas

1987 *A Guide to Musical Analysis*. London, J.M. Dent & Sons.

1999 Analysing Performance and Performing Analysis, In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p. 239-261.

CONE, Edward T.

1987 Music as Form, In: *What is music? An Introduction to the Philosophy of Music*, Philip Alperson (Ed.). University park, Penn State University Press.

DIDIER-WEIL, Alain

1995 *Os três tempos da lei*. Rio de Janeiro, Jorge Zahar Editor.

EPSTEIN, David

1979 *Beyond Orpheus: Studies in Musical Structure*. Cambridge-Mass: Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

FERRARA, Lawrence

1991 *Philosophy and the Analysis of Music: Bridges to Musical Sound, Form, and Reference*. Introduction. Bryn Mawr, Exelsior Publishing Co., p. xiii-xxi.

FINK, Robert

1999 Post-Hierarchical Music Theory and the Musical Surface. In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p.102-137.

FORTE, Allen e Steven Gilbert

1982 *Introduction to Schenkerian Analysis*. New York, Norton.

- GJERDINGEN, Robert
 1999 Experimental Music Theory?, In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p. 161-170.
- GOEHR, Lydia
 1992 *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- HASTY, Christopher
 1997 *Meter as Rhythm*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- KELLER, Hans
 1994 *Essays on music*. Christopher Wintle (Org.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- KERMAN, Joseph
 1985 *Musicologia*. Cap 3: Análise, teoria e música nova, p. 75-150. Lisboa, Martins Fontes.
- KORSYN, Kevin
 1999 Beyond Privileged Contexts: Intertextuality, Influence, and Dialogue, In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p. 55-72.
- KRAMER, Jonathan
 1988 *The Time of Music*. London, Schirmer.
- LASKE, Otto
 1991 Toward an epistemology of composition. *Interface*, Amsterdã, v. 20, p. 235-269.
- LERDAHL, Fred and Ray Jackendoff
 1983 *A Generative Theory of Tonal Music*. Cambridge, Massachusetts, MIT Press.
- LIMA, Paulo Costa.
 2000 *Estrutura e Superfície na Música de Ernst Widmer: As Estratégias Octatônicas*. Capítulo II: O Campo da Análise Musical, p. 34-76. São Paulo, Tese de Doutorado em Artes, Escola de Comunicações e Artes-Universidade de São Paulo.
- McCLARY, Susan
 1993 Narrative Agendas in “Absolute” Music: Identity and Difference in Brahms’s Third Symphony, In: *Musicology and Difference: Gender and Sexuality in Music Scholarship*. Los Angeles, University of California Press, p. 326-343.
- MEYER, Leonard and Grosvenor Cooper
 1960 *The Rhythmic Structure of Music*. Chicago, The University of Chicago Press.
- MONTGOMERY, David
 1989 The Myth of Organicism: From Bad Science to Great Art. *Musical Quarterly*, New York, p. 17-58
- NATTIEZ, Jean-Jacques
 1990 *Music and Discourse: Toward a Semiology of Music*. Princeton, Princeton University Press.

- RETI, Rudolph
1951 *The Thematic Process in Music*. New York, Macmillan.
- SAMSOM, Jim
(1999) *Analysis in Context*, In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p. 35-54.
- SCHÖNBERG, Arnold
1995 *The Musical Idea and the Logic, Technique, and Art of its Presentation*, Patricia Carpenter and Severine Neff (Eds.). New York, Columbia University Press.
- SERAFINE, Mary Louise
1988 *Music as Cognition: The Development of Thought in Sound*. New York, Columbia University Press.
- STRAUS, Joseph
1990 *Introduction to Post-Tonal Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, Prentice Hall.
- STERBA, Richard
1939 *Toward the problem of the musical process*. Artigo apresentado à Sociedade Psicanalítica de Chicago.
- TREITLER, Leo
1999 *The Historiography of Music: Issues of Past and Present*, In: *Rethinking Music*, Nicholas Cook e Mark Everist (Eds.). London, Oxford University Press, p. 356-377.
- WUORINEN, Charles
1979 *Simple Composition*. New York, C.F. Peters.

<p>Autores Brasileiros a serem 'visitados' pela breve exposição dedicada ao assunto: Mário de Andrade, Esther Scliar, Willy Correa de Oliveira, Regis Duprat, Jamary Oliveira, Ilza Nogueira, Ricardo Tacuchian, Cristina Gerling, Celso Chaves, Ricardo Saltini.</p>

Janelas ou Iscas

1.

Of all the sacrosanct preserves of art music today, the most prestigious, the most carefully protected is a domain known as ‘absolute music’: music purported to operate on the basis of pure configurations, untainted by words, stories, or even affect...

The viability of apparently autonomous instrumental music depends on the powerful affective codes that have developed within the referential domains of vocal music. Familiarity with this network of cultural associations permits us to recognize even in the textless music traditional signs for grief, joy, or the heroic. But signification extends far beyond the surface in instrumental music: its formal conventions – often held to be neutral with respect to meaning – are likewise socially encoded... Classical instrumental music depends on two interlocking narrative schemata, tonality and sonata. I am referring here to tonality, not in the broad sense of pitch-centeredness (which would include most of Western music), but in the more specific sense of the grammatical and structural syntax of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century European musics... For our present purposes it is sufficient to recognize that the history of tonality was shaped by its social contexts and that tonality operates according to a standard sequence of dynamic events, giving the music it organizes a narrative cast.

2.

Music is a bodily experience in the fullest sense: a richly corporeal mode of being that integrates mind, emotion, all the senses, an entire person... Sound is not music, although the musically behaving person experiences musical significance by means of, or through, the sounds. In sonorous experience that is musical, sounds become transparent... Let music be allowed to speak for itself, revealing its own order and meaning; and that the distorting potential of habitual or ‘logical’ presuppositions be avoided. What, then, are music’s essential modes of being...?

Traditional music analysis takes things like pitch and interval as basic substances to which features like timbre, dynamics, and expressive qualities somehow adhere as ‘attributes’. Do we really hear *col legno* as something simply attached to the primary substance of pitch? ... What counts as lived musical experiences are such intuited essences as the grace of a minuet by Mozart, the drama of a symphony by Mahler, or the agony of Coltrane’s jazz. If we hear the music at all, it is because we hear the grace, the drama, and the agony as essential constituents of... the music itself. It is not even accurate enough to say that these constituents are what the music is *about*: rather they are the music...

Despite its experiential immediacy, tonality is not foundational either. If I did not already have a prior understanding of motion in time, of ‘toward’ and ‘away from’, rest and tension, beginning and ending, anticipation and fulfillment, how would I ever recognize in myself the power to appropriate precisely these tones, through the medium of which a certain kind of motion, etc., called ‘tonality’, is particularized? Viewed from a lived, bodily informed perspective, what is essential to music are its temporal, spatial, playful, and felt dimensions.

3.

Every succession of tones produces unrest, conflict, problems... Every musical form can be considered as an attempt to treat this unrest either by halting or limiting it, or by solving the problem... Through the connection of tones of different pitch, duration and emphasis, unrest comes into being: a state of rest is placed in question through a contrast... Each composition raises a question, puts up a problem which in the course of the piece has to be answered, resolved, carried

through. It has to be carried through many contradictory situations; it has to be developed by drawing conclusions from what it postulates... and all this might lead to a conclusion, a pronunciamento.

4.

A relatively recent enterprise might be summarized as the effort to integrate structural and semantic-expressive aspects of musical works in the act of analysis by developing concepts capable of functioning simultaneously in both domains. Musical plot, defined as the integrated formal and semantic content of a musical work, is the most inclusive concept of this kind: the Ursatz of musical narrative, and a symbol of aspiration toward a grand unified theory of musical processes. The quest to formulate viable models of plot and so give shape to what is as yet only an intriguing abstraction, is among the more formidable challenges in contemporary music theory. The burden for anyone attempting such a formulation on the premise that structure and content are indecomposable is to demonstrate how one might account for the integration of formal and semantic-expressive aspects of musical works from the level of motives and phrases to that of entire movements or works.

5.

In thinking about music it is difficult to avoid representing any concrete instance as if it were a stable and essentially pre-formed entity composed of fully determinate and ultimately static objects or relations... The challenge of taking the temporal nature into account lies in finding ways of speaking of music's very evanescence and thus of developing concepts that would capture both the determinacy and the indeterminacy of events in passage... Among the attributes of rhythm we might include continuity or flow, articulation, regularity, proportion, repetition, pattern, alluring form or shape, expressive gesture, animation, and motion (or at least the semblance of motion)... If we were to restrict the preceding list of attributes to those that are susceptible to calibration and measurement, it might be said that music theory presents us with a reasonably clear understanding of rhythm. Thus restricted, rhythm is identified with meter, durational pattern, or durational proportion. ...But if we restrict musical rhythm to meter, pattern, and proportion, we feel that something essential has been left out of account.

6.

What is a musical system? It may most simply be conceived as a set of defined operations on a set of defined elements. Thus it is contrasted with a musical method, which is a set of procedures for composing a specific piece. A musical system requires some conceptual justification in its assertions and thus possesses a flavor of the analytic. Usually it is general in nature and is intended to embrace a large number of pieces. By contrast, a method is simply what you do to write a certain kind of piece. It is empirical and requires no conceptual justification... Now what the operations and elements are in a musical system may be variable ...(For an example of operations and elements, consider the tonal system. In modulating from C major to G major, the elements are the seven tones of the diatonic major scale, and the operation is transposition)...One could construct any number of arbitrarily defined musical systems, and these can exist apart from any actual compositions...

Music is certainly not a one-dimensional phenomenon... When we hear even the simplest piece of music, we are aware of a sense of depth; that is, we not only identify the succession and combination of sounds in the immediate foreground, but also perceive a more deeply buried 'background' – a more general and abstract network of relationships – out of which the immediate, local, and more superficial aspects of the composition seem to arise. Furthermore, we usually are aware of not just two layers of this sort, but rather a multiplicity of them, and they are not isolated from each other...

7.

Musical works enjoy a very obscure mode of existence... Works cannot, in any straightforward sense, be physical, mental, or ideal objects. They do not exist as concrete, physical objects; they do not exist as private ideas existing in the mind of a composer, a performer, or a listener; neither do they exist in the eternally existing world of ideal, uncreated forms. They are not identical, furthermore, to any one of their performances... Neither are works identical to their scores... And if all copies of the score of a Beethoven Symphony are destroyed, the symphony itself does not thereby cease to exist, or so it has been argued.

‘The idea that music is exemplified in works...is far from self-evident’. This statement, made by Carl Dahlhaus, is correct. Musical practice can be, but need not be, governed by the work-concept, and it is at most historically contingent whether or not it is... a concept can become so entrenched within a practice that it gradually takes on all the airs and graces of necessity. Thus it has become extraordinarily difficult for us nowadays to think about music – specially so-called classical music – in terms other than those associated with the work-concept. Yet for most of its history the tradition of ‘serious’ music was not thought about in these terms...

First there is the Platonist view. In one of its articulations, musical works are argued, contrary to common sense, to be universals, constituted by structures of sounds... They exist even if no performances or score-copies are ever produced... There is an alternative way to characterize the Platonist view. It shares with the first the idea that works exist over and above their performances and score-copies. It differs because it takes works to be quasi-Platonic entities, quasi-Platonic because they are created... works are spatio-temporally bounded – dependent upon the compositional activity that brought them into existence and upon spatio-temporal properties of particulars that instantiate them...

In an Aristotelian view, works are essences (typically sound structures) exhibited in performances and score-copies. As with Platonist views, works are abstract in so far as they are sound-patterns exemplified in different performances. Yet works are essential structures or patterns belonging to and inhering in other things, rather than distinct entities in their own right...

The third way to conceive of works is to attribute to them no form of abstract existence. To talk of works is to talk only as if there were works; only concrete performances and score-copies exist... Hence, works are no more than linguistic terms... This characterization falls under the nominalist view... Another way to think about works originates in the writings of Croce and Collingwood... one can extrapolate from their writings what has come to be known as an idealist view. Works are now identified with ideas formed in the mind of composers. These ideas, once formed, find objectified expression through score-copies or performances and are, thereby, made publicly accessible...

8.

The assertion that abstract musical artworks have a surface, and thus also have a hidden interiority and depth, underlies what is perhaps the single most important metaphor of structuralist musical analysis. It is with some trepidation that I reconsider this fundamental assumption, since to give it up would cut one loose from the very foundations of music theory as practiced today. It remains undeniable that surface-depth models of music have led to elegant, totalizing representations of musical structure that appeal to many...

The surface-depth metaphor, since it leads to the assumption of musical hierarchy and a theory of structural levels, underpins the most influential claims – Schenkerian analysis and set theory – that all great music has hidden organic unity, no matter how complex, chaotic, or incomplete the listener’s experience of its ‘surface’ may be. In the face of much recent music which, in a peculiarly postmodern way, exalts surface and flouts depth, one might begin to question whether hierarchy is the best index of value in contemporary music – or even in the canonic master-works that submit so satisfyingly to hierarchical music theories... I do not think it possible to prove the presence or absence of surface and depth in music.... But whether or not music has surface and hierarchical depth, it is an indisputable fact that much of the analytical discourse around music assumes that it does.

9.

One speaks of music as segmented into units of all sizes, of patterns of strong and weak beats, of thematic relationships, of pitches as ornamental or structurally important, of tension and repose, and so forth. Insofar as one wishes to ascribe some sort of ‘reality’ to these kinds of structure, one must ultimately treat them as mental products imposed on or inferred from the physical signal. In our view, the central task of music theory should be to explicate this mentally produced organization. Seen in this way, music theory takes a place among traditional areas of cognitive psychology such as theories of vision and language.

This perspective sheds a different light on two recent theoretical trends. On the one hand, in principle it offers an empirical criterion for limiting mathematical formulations of musical structure; not every conceivable organization of a musical signal can be perceived by a human listener. One can imagine some mathematical relationship to obtain between every tenth note of a piece, but such a relationship would in all likelihood be perceptually irrelevant and musically unenlightening. On the other hand, this approach takes artistic intuition out of isolation and relates it to mental life in general. It becomes possible to explain artistically interesting aspects of musical structure in terms of principles that account for simple musical phenomena. The insights of an ‘artistic’ approach can thus be incorporated into a large and more explanatory framework...

Once a listener becomes familiar with an idiom, the kind of organization that he attributes to a given piece will not be arbitrary but will be highly constrained in specific ways. In our view a theory of a musical idiom should characterize such organization in terms of an explicit formal musical grammar that models the listener’s connection between the presented musical surface of a piece and the structure he attributes to the piece.

10.

Conceiving text and context as a stable opposition promotes a compartmentalization of musical research, dividing the synchronic analysis of internal structure from the diachronic narratives of history... Thus we inhabit a conceptual space ruled by metaphors of ‘inside’ and ‘outside’. You are either ‘inside’ the piece, securing its boundaries through ‘internal’ analysis, or you are ‘outside’, mapping its position with respect to other closed units. You can alternate between internal and external perspectives, tilting like a see-saw, but you can’t occupy both positions at once... The controversy between analysis and history masks and underlying complicity, because both disciplines rely on the text/context dualism. You can’t scape the prison-house of the autonomous text by appealing to context, because you’re still confined by the same binary scheme. This is the impasse, the crisis, of musical research...

A decisive step here was taken by Derrida, who showed that the inside/outside opposition that sustains the traditional notion of the closed text is vulnerable to deconstruction... Mikhail Bakhtin, working in a different tradition, was advocating a decentralized model of literature, replacing the

'monologic' belief in self-sufficient texts with the study of 'dialogic' relationships. Julia Kristeva, who was among the first to introduce Bakhtin to western audiences, combined his dialogic methods with insights current in France, including Derridean 'writing'. It was in two essays on Bakhtin that she invented the term 'intertextuality': 'Any text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations; any text is the absorption and transformation of another...

11.

The historical study of music has hardly been conducted on the grounds of serious reflection about historiographical principles in the first place... Yet the political alertness that finds the theme of patriarchal authoritarianism and hegemony in the descriptions by traditional historians of 'coherent' and 'unified' cultures or historical processes of organic and evolutionary development, together with the stylistic alertness to the production of unified, coherent texts that describe such cultures, have jointly identified a powerful cultural value that is translated into historiographic principles that mutually support one another. There is no doubt something to this link between style and content, and it was an interesting suggestion of Carl Dahlhaus to break the circularity that it entails by adopting the narratives of Proust and Joyce as models for new history in place of those of Sir Walter Scott, which served nineteenth-century historians...

Postmodern skepticism about the rule of objectivity has placed the historical object in danger of fading, and the practice of both the contextualism (new historicism) and the skepticism and relativism (new philosophy of history) taken to their extremes, can hasten and augment that tendency. Through the former, the historical object can be so densely contextualized as to be camouflaged into invisibility; through the latter, it can disappear in the brilliant glare of idiosyncratic virtuoso writing that seizes upon the discovery of the inventive side of history...

The discovery that the study of music has been grounded on the premiss of the autonomous work and the recognition that this premiss is refuted by the fact that the musical work, like its composer and its reception, is deeply embedded in the culture in which it participates and to which it contributes have been followed too quickly by the dogmatic imposition of an obligatory, absolute abstinence from the autonomy concept and the adoption of that ban as one of the main banners of 'new' musical studies. Engagement with the musical work in its autonomy is the beginning, not the end, of historical interpretation.

12.

It is considered proven that music is based on anal and narcissistic instinctual foundations, but analytical investigation has not gone further than this. .. In every work of art conscious and unconscious instinctual wishes are expressed and represented in the form of an image of the outside world. The difference between the real outside world and the image of it created by the artist enables us to recognize, by means of psychoanalytic investigation, the constitution of the unconscious emotional reactions and tendencies. We call these unconscious emotional reactions and tendencies the latent content of a work of art. But to apply this method of investigation to music is impossible, since in music the conscious and unconscious emotions are not expressed in the form of images of the outside world. Music is what we may call an objectless art.

13.

1. Structure is clarified through perspective. The small and the large, particularly with respect to melody and harmony, are seen separately; 2. A distinction between structure and embellishment emanates from perspective. Structure determines long-range formal projection. Embellishment does

not; 3) Musical structure is revealed in layers... 4) Harmony, particularly at intermediary points, is shown as resulting from line and counterpoint. It is put in realistic perspective, removed from the textbook distortions of verticality, inversion, chord labels; 5. Harmonic movement in the large, and the key centers other than the tonic that it engenders, are seen in relation to the primacy of the tonic, the only true tonality of a work. The conventional idea of 'modulation' is replaced...; 6. The concept of compositional unfolding is introduced.

14.

Organicism and its related models, nature and biology, are not only pervasive; they are invasive in that they affect many other prevalent covert values for example, such positive ones as 'economy/economical', 'exhaustion of motives', 'natural and idiomatic' (as in figuration or scoring), 'concentration' (as in late or mature works as opposed to early ones). Further, the entire constellation, from talk of 'flowering from seed' and 'goal-directed processes', to 'gradual transformation', 'fluidity', and so on...

The core metaphor of organicism, that of a seed germinating and developing into a full-blown plant, occurs not only in the writings of Heinrich Schenker, Rudolph Reti and their disciples (all of which are well-known examples of organicism in musical analyses), but is very much alive among writers of program notes and music appreciation texts. The seed metaphor is sown early in music education!

15.

What might be called 'structurally informed performance', as urged by Berry or Narmour, aims, then, at a more or less literal translation of the product of analysis. I have no wish to deny that such a style of performance is possible, or indeed that it may be a valid option (although such structurally informed performance can all too easily verge on the patronizing or, to use William Rothstein's word, pedantic). But the point is precisely that it is an option, which is to say that there are other options, and this is something that cannot be formulated in terms of the dualistic language of 'expressing', 'projecting', and bringing out' structure.

Rosenwald suggests that...'perhaps we could get a livelier dialogue between performer and analyst if the performer were prepared, on analytic grounds, to make a case for the performance of unstructural or antistructural details'. Certainly it would be an interesting theoretical task to define general situations in which performing 'against' the structure is an appropriate strategy, whether because 'the music is so clear that the interpreter may occasionally phrase against formal segmentations of the music without placing that dimension of the music in jeopardy of total loss', or because a piece is too well known and needs defamiliarizing.

16

In introducing the theory of composition as an integral part of music theory, and of composition as a paradigm of equal status to that of listening in investigating musical activity, I make a distinction between two modes of compositional comportment: example-based and rule-based composition. I consider both of these as model-based activities, in that the former rests on a model of existing musical objects, and the latter, on a model of one's own or somebody else's (remembered) musical process. Therefore, the thesis put forth here is that composition is always model-based... Composition theory, as here understood, has been investigated by C. Ames, L. Hiller, G.M. Koenig, J. Tenney, B. Truax, I. Xenakis and others, both in terms of theories and programs...

Holistically, design is a relational order between a designer and his environment; internal representations of the environment reflect the interaction between designer and design; from a point of view of form, the boundaries between designer-self and environment-object are in constant flux;

the design creates the designer as much as the designer creates the design. To clarify this dialectics, I introduce the notion of compositional life cycle...

The cycle originates in a plan based on an idea and, via the generation of materials, proceeds to three models of the art work: a model of materials (M1), a general design model (M2), and a detailed design model (M3). Overall, the cycle passes through four levels, viz., the analysis, synthesis, specification, and implementation levels; it ends in the finished art work. (Fig 1)

17

Let us think what it would mean for an analysis to be genuinely scientific and objective. It would mean that you could get the right results simply by following given procedures correctly: intuitive judgements about the music would not be involved. This means that if an analytical method were really scientific and objective, then you ought to be able to get a computer to do the analysis for you – you feed in the music, and out comes the analysis...

For example Michael Kassler, who was formerly one of Babbitt's students at Princeton, has been trying to write a computer program that will carry out a Schenkerian analysis on any music you feed into it. As far as I know he has not fully achieved this yet...

How, asks Fred T. Hofstetter, can you test something like Cobbet's statement that 'the spirit of nationalism is felt in all of the best chamber music?' By looking for some measurable stylistic criterion which will show whether 'composers differ from one another as a function of their nationalities'. What would be a suitable criterion for this? Again, what is wanted is unconscious stylistic habits 'which the composer leaves like fingerprints upon the music he creates... In fact the relative frequency of melodic intervals is often used as a stylistic criterion by ethnomusicologists, though not in such a sophisticated way as in the computer study we have just looked.

18

There is no art that produces as much comfort for the mind feeling and thinking it, and as much discomfort for the mind thinking about it, as the so-called art of music... I should prefer to call it a mode of thought, and hence of life, for reasons which will emerge...

The power of musical logic is so overwhelming because while conceptual logic convinces intellectually, musical logic convinces both emotionally and intellectually, and thus has the effect of a revelation whose truth, on top of it all, you are able to demonstrate – or should be able to demonstrate, anyway, in purely musical terms... Music – recent notational works of art apart – is thought and heard right outside the visual and conceptual intellect.

Musical meaning, emotionally experienced in the first place and, purely in terms of sound, intellectually definable in the second, depends for its sheer existence on the clearly implied conflict between that which you hear and that which is being contradicted by what you hear. It is this tension, varying in intensity according to the structural juncture a composition has reached, between what the composer does and what he makes you feel he was expected to do that constitutes musical logic. The clearer the tension, the more logical the music – and the clearest tension is that which combines a maximum of contradiction with a maximum of unity between the contradicting elements... Hence, while *conceptual logic depends on predictability* – all M is P, some S is M, so? – *musical logic depends on unpredictability*.

19

Let us identify linearity as the determination of some characteristic(s) of music in accordance with implications that arise from earlier events of the piece. Thus linearity is processive. Nonlinearity, on

the other hand, is nonprocessive. It is the determination of some characteristic(s) of music in accordance with implications that arise from principles or tendencies governing an entire piece or section. Let us also define linear time as the temporal continuum created by a succession of events in which earlier events imply later ones and later ones are consequences of earlier ones. Nonlinear time is the temporal continuum that results from principles permanently governing a section or piece. The many varieties of time (directed linear time, nondirected linear time, multiply-directed linear time, moment time, and vertical time) arise from different degrees and kinds of interaction between linear and nonlinear time.

20.

In Western music as a whole (and in much non-Western music, too), the overall shape of a work seems to be perceived largely in terms of its development toward a focal or high point, or climax, whether the work is a single line that rises to a high point shortly before its end, or a large symphonic piece with its climactic intensification at the close. How such a sense of culmination is achieved cannot be divorced from the musical system employed in the work where it is located. But in general, we might characterize the sense of large formal process implicit in the work as 'developmental', for the musical material is usually 'developed' in the following manner: presented in an exposition, then transformed in some way which, contextually, seems to intensify it, and brought to a close, the arrival of which is in turn 'justified' by the acts of intensification which had preceded it...

These formal patterns still underlie almost all compositional activity, but that often they are much more subtly expressed than they were in the past. Furthermore, there is at least one major twentieth-century contribution to the storehouse of large formal patterns, and it often seems to complement the developmental continuity we have been considering. Indeed, the influence of this second type probably interpenetrates with the first in most pieces composed nowadays. This second type is a continuity made by the juxtaposition of dissimilar elements. Archetypal examples of these two major kinds of continuity from our era may be found in Stravinsky for the juxtapositional, and Schönberg for the developmental...

21.

It is against a broad, heterogeneous background that any attempt to assess the challenge of musical semiotics should proceed. For in the twenty years or so of active research in musical semiotics, there is no sign that practitioners subscribe to the same basic tenets... Semiotics, in short, applies in every circumstance that music is produced and consumed. It has been adapted to the analysis of the pre-tonal, tonal, and post-tonal repertoires. Moreover, semiotics does not endorse what some feel is an essentially political or commercial distinction between 'high' art and 'low' or popular art... Nor does it insist on a distinction between Western and non-Western music. The crucial question is whether this breadth of application indicates an uncommonly powerful explanatory potential, or whether it is nothing but a sign of generality bordering on the trivially universal...

In their most extensive analytical demonstrations of semiotic method, Ruwet and Nattiez employ the notion of musical units rather than musical signs, thus neutralizing the notion of sign and domesticating it for an art that many believe to be foundationally asemantic. Talk of musical units, which allows semiotics to collapse into classical structuralism, is valid and helpful: but it has the disadvantage of derailing the enterprise of searching for musical meanings that arise from specific histories and societies... I shall exemplify some aspects of semiotic method, noting the assumptions that support their moves and arguing that units, defined as elementary oppositional elements in a closed structure, subtend 'semantic' meanings whether or not such meanings are made explicit...

22

The form of a composition, at the most detailed level, depends on connections among the basic elements of duration, stress and pitch. From those connections and from the relations among them, the shape of the whole gradually becomes clear as the work unfolds. There can be no argument about the basic elements, since they are common to all music; but what principles govern their ordering and hierarchization?... In a previous discussion I raised this question and suggested three possibilities: ‘What is the nature of musical form? Is it controlled primarily by succession – moment to moment progression? Or by agglutination – the addition of part to part? Or by accretion – organic growth? Or if by all these, in what relationship?’

23.

Quando escuto música, por que fico encantado por ela? Porque se passa alguma coisa para a qual não estou preparado... quando escuto soar a música, descubro, a cada vez, com espanto, que não posso deixar de lhe dizer ‘sim’... A quê, então, digo ‘sim’? A uma transmutação subjetiva que revira, e, a cada vez, de maneira muito perturbadora, minha posição de sujeito ouvido em sujeito que ouve: com efeito, quando eu acreditava me engajar no ato de escutar a música, eis que descubro, no instante em que ela soa, que é ela que me ouve. O que ela ouve? Que ouvi, no que ela havia me dado a ouvir, um apelo ao qual respondi um ‘sim’ cuja extrema simplicidade não em igual, a não ser seu caráter enigmático: não sei, com efeito, a quem eu disse ‘sim’ nem quem disse ‘sim’. No máximo, sei que, por este ‘sim’, uma articulação é produzida entre um receptor que, em mim, recebeu o apelo dirigido pela música e a aparição de um emissor que se dirige à música para chamá-la. Por este ‘sim’, sou, ao mesmo tempo, o que diz: ‘Sim, sou chamado por você’, e : ‘Sim, eu chamo você’.

24.

Those who espouse the social view of music maintain that music is always and fundamentally a mode of human activity, something people do with of for each other. As such, its true nature cannot be adequately grasped by looking inward, as phenomenology and psychology often seem inclined to do, or ‘outward’, as formalists sometimes seem to do. Music is socially constructed, socially embedded, and its nature and value are inherently social. Musical practices are not the kind of things that have a fixed, durable, objective ‘essence’ or inner core; they are constituted by collective human actions. The notion of a music in-itself, of ‘music alone’, is one that not only impedes and distorts understanding, it is deeply pernicious because it encourages people to overlook what may in fact be most important about music: the ways it shapes and defines human society. Music is not something that occasionally and tangentially serves social ends, then: it is itself social, always and already.

25

Today, whenever I attend a meeting of music theorists, I am struck by the conviction with which old beliefs are invoked as eternal verities. ‘Tonality’, like Aristotle’s ‘principle of the soul’, is asserted as an agent in the world. ‘Voice-leading’, like Aristotle’s ‘heat’, is given causal force as an explanation of why musical things are the way they are. The waxing and waning of these principles seemingly create music history, govern style, and, ‘proceeding a little further in this way’, determine hearing itself. Recent attempts to ‘problematize’ these verities have resulted in complexified dogma. The basic terms of the debate, however, remain unchanged. As a result, music-theoretical discourse has become largely music-exegetical in content. The self-stabilizing, corroborating effect of interdependent premisses precludes fundamental revisions, major discoveries, or even accidental breakthroughs...

Although music theory endorses experiment, and grants the presumption that experiments are skilfully performed and accurately reported, the interpretation of experimental results takes place in a no man’s land between disciplines with very different histories, mores, central subject-matters,

and professional goals. Take, for example, a hypothetical experiment in melodic perception. The psychologist who sets up the experiment may be seeking correlates in the auditory system for some well-studied phenomena in the visual system. The history of that prior research in vision will dictate the outlines of the proposed study in music...

The measurement of things musical is frequently problematic...

Psychologists know the pitfalls associated with trying to measure a mental state or process...

26

Up to this point, we have dealt with the musical fact as a symbolic fact. But we cannot advance farther in the semiological approach to music without bringing the investigation to bear upon analysis itself. An analysis in effect states itself in the form of a discourse – spoken or written – and it is consequently the product of an action; it leaves a trace and gives rise to readings, interpretations, and criticisms. Although we find the tripartite dimension of all symbolic forms in analysis as well, analysis is nonetheless not merely a semiological fact comparable to others discussed so far. Analysis exists because it deals with another object – the musical fact being analyzed. In other words, discourse about music is a metalanguage. Consequently, an epistemological and semiological examination of analysis involves three elements:

The object: the object of a science is not an immediate given; all description, all analysis considers its object from a certain standpoint... [*analytical situation, variables, parameters*]

The metalanguage: What are the types of discourse used in musical analysis? [*Types of discourse, a poietics, readings*]

The methodology of analysis. Analysis is no pure reflection of the object (music). There is, in the analytical process, a transition, controlled by implicit or explicit *procedures*, from the work to the analysis...

One cannot help but be struck by the diversity of analytical styles on the market, particularly in the case of the divergent analyses of the same piece... This divergence, troubling as it may be for the novice, should not be thought of as some sort of institutional scandal. It is, instead, the inevitable result of the symbolic nature of musical and analytical facts; that is, it results from the fact that we are presented with a very large latitude of choice between all possible interpretations released by the corpus being studied...

Six analytical situations:

- (I) Immanent analysis - a type of analysis that tackles only the immanent configurations of the work.
- (II) Inductive poietics - one can proceed from an analysis of the neutral level to drawing conclusions about the poietic. This is one of the most frequently encountered situations in musical analysis...
- (III) External poietics - In this case, the situation is reversed. The musicologist takes a poietic document – letters, plans, sketches – as his or her point of departure, and analyzes the work in the light of this information...
- (IV) Inductive esthetics – This sort of analysis grounds itself in perceptive introspection [“at that moment, m.11, the listener discovers that this motif is the head of the fugue subject.
- (V) External esthetics – One can, on the other hand, begin with information collected from listeners, to attempt to understand how the work has been perceived. This is how experimental psychologists would work.
- (VI) Communication of the three levels - This is the case in which no immanent analysis is equally relevant to the poietic as to the esthetic. Schenker’s theory is a good example...

27

Scholars have written programs that read, analyze, and report patterns found in musical compositions. Twelve encoding languages have been developed for translating musical notation into computer-readable form. Robinson's (1967) Intermediate Musical Language (IML) and Bauer-Mengelberg's (1970) Digital Alternate Representation of Musical Symbols (DARMS) are alphanumeric codes designed so the user need not know musical notation...

Fifteen scholars have written analytical programs that find patterns in encoded scores. Maurita and Roland Brender (1967) wrote programs for describing part or voice crossing, melodic intervals, and triads. Youngblood (1970) wrote a program to perform Hindemithian analysis of root progressions. Suchoff (1968) computerized Bartok's method of folk-song analysis. Gabura (1970) and Forte (1966) developed programs to study pitch and interval relations. Lekoff (1970) wrote a program to find correlations among the 48 permutations of a twelve-tone row. Fuller (1970) and Mendel (1969) developed simultaneity analysis programs. Winograd (1968) wrote programs for the analysis of harmony as a linguistic system. Programs by Roller (1965) dealt with harmonic intervals, chord repetitions, Hindemith roots, and melodic intervals. Patrick (1974) developed a program to study suspension-formations in the Masses of Josquin des Prez. Hofstetter (1979) programmed the computer to develop stylistic ratios that describe geographical influences on the composition of nineteenth-century nationalistic chamber music. Stech (1981) used the computer to perform microanalysis of melodic lines. And Blombach (1982) performed pattern analysis on 150 Bach chorales, pointing out scalar contradictions and harmonic implications. In addition to analysis of compositional habits, another important use of the computer has been to analyze sound itself. ...

At present, music analysis software remains the personal tool of its developer. It is hoped that some day a user-friendly, general purpose analysis system can be published to aid scholars in the study of music.

28

Reti's studies are characterized by a largely intuitive approach, and by an almost total absence of methodical proof. Thus while he has some valid insights, his presentation often marshals dubious evidence, with the effect of weakening the credibility of his contributions. Terminology is only minimally defined; neither are criteria presented for discerning the structural from the ornamental within themes. Little or no account is taken of structural levels; nor the roles of stress, accent, syncopation, or rhythm in general; nor of harmony. The scale degrees upon which structural notes may rest are often left undistinguished. Thus two themes in different keys may be seen as congruent, where the same note in one rests on the tonic and in the other on, perhaps, the submediant, with different accompanying harmonic implications. Much of the writing simply asserts, equating conjecture with proof, or stumbles upon the intentional fallacy. This is particularly true of the chapter on thematic key relations in *The Thematic Process in Music*, where the mere existence of two notes relevant to a theme is given as proof that they generate key relations on the same roots, with no further demonstration.

29.

The Humdrum Toolkit provides a set of inter-related software tools intended to assist in music research. The toolkit is suitable for use in a wide variety of computer-based musical investigations. The toolkit is less well suited to creative (i.e. generative) musical tasks -- such as electroacoustic composition.

Humdrum is a general-purpose software system intended to assist music researchers in posing and answering research questions. Humdrum's capabilities are quite abstract, and so it is difficult to characterize precisely what it can do. Humdrum can encode information in an unbounded variety of forms. It can transform, classify, coordinate, search, transfer, restructure, contextualize, compare, and otherwise manipulate both pre-defined and user-defined information.

Humdrum will be of potential benefit to anyone wishing to pursue systematic investigations of musical information. This includes the posing of factual questions about music and the testing of hypotheses about musical organization. Humdrum may thus prove to be of use to music theorists, music analysts, ethnomusicologists, historical musicologists, psychomusicologists, music librarians, dance scholars, linguists, and others.

-- from The Humdrum Toolkit Reference Manual, copyright © 1994 David Huron

For additional information, see the [Humdrum FAQ](#), the [demonstration files](#), and the [Humdrum Newsletter](#).

Humdrum Toolkit Demonstration

N.B. The following information is excerpted from the demonstration files provided with Humdrum. Each of these files is a script, performing its calculations in real time and producing the output given here. Each of the lines that perform a calculation are indicated by emphasized type. Only the examples NOT requiring a MIDI installation are provided here. For a complete demonstration, including MIDI capabilities, please come by the Digital Media Center.

Please Note: These sample problems are intended for illustrative purposes only. They are not intended to be carefully constructed scholarly arguments.

- [Prevalence of melodic arches in traditional folk ballads](#)
- [Comparison of alto and tenor suspensions in choral harmonizations](#)
- [Dynamic "swell" gestures in piano works by Brahms](#)
- [Predominance of upward melodic leaps in Schubert lieder](#)
- [Comparison of syncopation in George Gershwin and Stephen Foster](#)

Humdrum Newsletter

- [Issue no. 1](#)
- [Issue no. 2](#)
- [Issue no. 3](#)

Other interesting tidbits

- [Review of Humdrum in Music Theory Online, vol. 2.7](#)
- [List of regular expressions matching Humdrum constructs](#)
- [A brief mention of Humdrum in relation to Indiana University's Variations project](#)
- [A proposal to include music characters in ISO/IEC 10646 \(Unicode\)](#)

[Electronic Centers](#) | [Clemons Library](#) | [University Library](#) | [University Home](#)

Maintained by: dmmc@virginia.edu

30

The blues is largely the product of a diasporic people, though the genre did not originate in Africa. When procedures recognizable as blues first entered the historical record around 1900, they already testified to centuries of fusions with North American genres... But most specialists identify in the blues a great many typically African elements. They argue persuasively that African Americans managed to maintain and transmit a core of collective memory while in exile, especially through their music. For example, blues musicians privilege a vast palette of sounds that European-trained ears tend to hear as distorted or out of tune... Most important is the way the blues operates according to certain models of social interaction characteristic of African cultures.. The blues seems to have emerged from many different kinds of musics, including shouts, spirituals, gospel hymns, field hollers, ritual laments, dances, and virtually every musical genre that African Americans had encountered... Viewed from a European vantage point and with European criteria, the blues might seem impoverished. Indeed, a more rigid convention is difficult to imagine, as a three-phrase harmonic pattern with a two-line poetic scheme is repeated in verse after verse, blues number after blues number. And yet it is the formulaic status of that pattern that has enabled it to give rise to so many rich and varied repertoires...

When middle class kids and British art students ‘universalized’ blues by making it the vehicle for their own alienation, many black musicians chose to develop other modes of expression. For some of them, in any case, the blues had come to recall times of rural poverty and victimization – the genealogy sedimented into the blues had moved to the foreground for them, drowning out other registers of meaning. Thus it is no coincidence that rap musicians have worked to construct a different heritage, tracing their roots through sampling and quotation back not to the blues per se but to James Brown and soul – a genre of black music that emerged during the decade when white rockers arrogated the blues unto themselves. For African Americans the blues was always just one particular manifestation of a number of deeper elements that live on in other genres. It was never a fetish, but simply a vehicle for expression. When historical conditions changed, when it became reified, it could be left behind.

31

There appears to be considerable interest these days in motivic analysis, and I must confess that I have chosen this topic because it is an area of particular interest to me. I hope to clarify the difference between Schenker’s notion of motive, as tied to his larger concept of structural levels, and other approaches to the subject. The best place to begin, as far as I am concerned, is with the term ‘motive’ itself, for it is the different meanings of this word that have given rise to a certain amount of confusion. As most commonly used, ‘motive’ implies a figure, whose main feature is its rhythmic pattern – in short, a ‘motif’. Such is the initial idea of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony. Though its original statement can be defined in terms of pitch, its repetitions are recognizable not in terms of pitch but in terms of rhythm. I would suggest that a more precise label for surface patterns of this sort is ‘rhythmic motive’. Such a notion is tied to the musical surface, since at deeper levels an idea is no longer defined, or perhaps I should say ‘perceived’ by a particular rhythmic articulation. Now we are beginning to approach Schenker’s concept of motive. To be sure, Schenker did recognize and often described repetitions of motives at the surface, but he also observed repetitions at deeper levels, where the motive becomes obscured by its elaboration. Such a ‘hidden’ repetition, to use one of Schenker’s terms, is defined not by its rhythmic articulation but by its ordered pitch content in relation to the original statement, which may be at the same level or transposed.